## RACE FOR THE WHITE HOUSE: AN ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT GUIDE

reterre

# Bloomberg BNA

By Anthony Adragna and Rachel Leven

Transmitti

## Race for the White House: An Energy & Environment Guide

**Election Analysis** / Page S-5

Candidate Snapshots / Page S-8

#### **ELECTION ANALYSIS**

<b>PRIMARIES</b> Clinton prodded on environmental issues, but candidate will likely stand her ground S-5
issues, but candidate will likely stand her ground S-5
<b>GENERAL ELECTION</b> Republican nominee likely to shift views on climate, observers say
CANDIDATE SNAPSHOTS
<b>CHART</b> A candidate-by-candidate comparison on energy and environmental issues
DEMOCRATS
<b>HILLARY CLINTON</b> Clinton aims to make U.S. clean energy super power, address warming quickly
<b>BERNIE SANDERS</b> Sanders pushes for strong climate action, highlights differences with ClintonS-15
MARTIN O'MALLEY O'Malley's detailed climate plan, state record draw praise from advocates
<b>JIM WEBB</b> Webb remembered as frequent thorn in Democrats' side on climate issues
<b>LINCOLN CHAFEE</b> Chafee signed climate bill as governor, helped block Clean Air Act rewrite
REPUBLICANS

 Profiles / Page S-14

<b>DONALD TRUMP</b> Trump alleges global warming conspiracy, backs Keystone pipelineS-20
<b>RICK PERRY</b> Climate change denier Perry touts wind, clean air successes
<b>MIKE HUCKABEE</b> Huckabee toes party line on energy issues, thinks climate science unsettled
<b>TED CRUZ</b> Energy proponent Cruz opposes environment regulations, renewable fuel mandate S-22
<b>MARCO RUBIO</b> Rubio quiet on environment, disputes role of human activity in climate changeS-23
<b>RAND PAUL</b> Some nuance seen for Paul on climate change, environmental justice issues
<b>CHRIS CHRISTIE</b> Christie's decision to leave RGGI said to undermine climate stance
JOHN KASICH Kasich acknowledges—but unsure of causes behind—climate changeS-26
<b>RICK SANTORUM</b> Santorum, who called global warming 'junk science,' softens climate rhetoric S-27
<b>GEORGE PATAKI</b> RGGI founder Pataki says it's unclear how much humans cause climate change S-27
<b>BOBBY JINDAL</b> Jindal acknowledges some human role in climate change, but favors fossil fuels
<b>CARLY FIORINA</b> Fiorina acknowledges human role in climate change, sees innovation as solutionS-29
<b>BEN CARSON</b> Carson says little on environment, disputes human role in climate changeS-29
<b>LINDSEY GRAHAM</b> Graham rare Republican urging action on 'moral' issue of climate changeS-30
JIM GILMORE Gilmore says little on environment but acknowledges climate changeS-31

# **Election 2016**

#### Elections

### Clinton Prodded on Environmental Issues, But Candidate Will Likely Stand Her Ground

emocratic rivals will push Hillary Clinton to adopt more progressive policy choices on environmental and energy issues during the party's primary, but the former secretary of state is unlikely to bow to the pressure, nearly two-dozen election observers told Bloomberg BNA.

Democratic rivals Sen. Bernie Sanders (Vt.) and former Maryland Gov. Martin O'Malley, seen as the more progressive environmental options in the field, will look to push Clinton on issues such as the Keystone XL pipeline, offshore drilling and hydraulic fracturing. They will be joined by some environmental advocates who see Clinton as weak on climate change.

But their efforts will likely fall short due to Clinton's consistent lead in polling and enormous financial advantage over her rivals, according to former members of Congress, lobbyists, former congressional aides, academics and others.

"Unless O'Malley or Sanders rise in the polls, she's not going to feel pressure to say more [on these issues]," Elizabeth Gore, policy director for law firm Brownstein Hyatt Farber Schreck and former Democratic aide, told Bloomberg BNA. "Absolutely, there's going to be an effort from the outside groups and candidates for her to do more. There's no reason for her to do so. She can adopt a more moderate or more opaque position on these issues, and she is better positioned going into the general [election]."

Observers acknowledged that a lingering question going into the Democratic primaries is whether Vice President Joe Biden will jump into the race, which would change the entire dynamics. They also noted that climate change and energy issues are low priorities for most voters, and few are likely to change their votes based on environmental stances alone.

"There are very few Democratic voters who are going to be attracted to a Jeb Bush position. Very few Republicans would cross over and vote for Hillary Clinton," Alan Abramowitz, a political science professor and election expert with Emory University, told Bloomberg BNA.

**Less Divisive for Republicans.** Still, environmental and energy issues are likely to play a much bigger role in the Democratic primaries than the Republican primaries, where observers see few significant policy differences among the many candidates.

Republican presidential candidates are nearly unanimous in their opposition to President Barack Obama's efforts to address climate change, favor expanding energy development and want to reduce regulations. That means energy and environmental issues will not be a way for these candidates to distinguish themselves in the crowded field of 17 candidates.

"On the Republican side, they are all basically singing from the same hymn book when it comes to energy and the environment," Ford O'Connell, a Republican strategist who advised Sen. John McCain (R-Ariz.) on energy issues during his 2008 presidential run, told Bloomberg BNA. "They're all pretty much saying the same thing."

Many see opposition to regulations and skepticism about the impact of human activity on the Earth's climate as a "litmus test" that will disqualify any candidate from the nomination if he or she fails to meet it.

"It's not to me a voting issue on the Democratic side, but it is on the Republican side," former Rep. Frederick "Rick" Boucher (D-Va.), now with law firm Sidley Austin LLP, told Bloomberg BNA. "Any variance from these degrees of faith would go a long way to eliminating someone from contention."

Former Sen. Kay Bailey Hutchison (R-Texas) told Bloomberg BNA that embracing continued development of U.S. energy sources would be a key issue for Republicans during the primary contest.

"I would be surprised if any Republican candidate is not for American energy independence. As a policy, as a part of our platform, it's probably one of the top five issues to be addressed [now]," said Hutchison, now a senior counsel for law firm Bracewell & Giuliani.

**Progressives Push Clinton.** Environmental advocates and progressive groups are trying to gauge how strongly the Democratic candidates are committed to addressing climate change according to their positions on issues such as Arctic drilling and the Keystone pipeline.

"We're trying to move [Clinton] to the left by underlining the groundswell for climate action on the left," Karthik Ganapathy, a spokesman for grass-roots organization 350 Action, told Bloomberg BNA. "We're not as worried about a Republican winding up in the White House as we are about Hillary Clinton allowing Arctic drilling or negotiating another weak trade deal or approving the Keystone pipeline."

Several other major environmental organizations such as the Natural Resources Defense Council Action Fund and League of Conservation Voters called climate issues a "race to the top" in the Democratic primary, pointing to Clinton's strong renewable energy plan and impressive record on environmental issues while serving in the U.S. Senate and as secretary of state.

But that view of Clinton is hardly unanimous among the environmental community, where uneasiness over the former secretary of state's commitment to tackling climate change has been bubbling for years. Ben Schreiber, climate and energy program director for Friends of the Earth Action, which endorsed Sanders Aug. 1, called Clinton's plan to address climate change "pretty moderate" so far. "Sen. Sanders has made up a lot of ground, and he's done so by talking about areas where Hillary is weak," Schreiber said, citing trade as an example. "Climate change is a weakness for Hillary."

**'Too Smart' to Engage.** Although they acknowledge that Clinton will face pressure from the left, observers—even many Republicans—told Bloomberg BNA that she is unlikely to take the bait from progressives on the environment.

"She's not going to say 'hell, no' on fracking or any of the things that would alienate the base in the general," Chris Miller, a former adviser on environmental issues to Senate Minority Leader Harry Reid (D-Nev.), told Bloomberg BNA. "She's too smart for that, and she's too far ahead in the polls. She doesn't have to."

Unless the dynamics of the race change significantly, Clinton isn't likely to feel the pressure to clarify her stances on issues like the Keystone XL pipeline, which she told a New Hampshire television station July 31 she could not discuss due to her prior official role in considering the project.

"I don't think she [Clinton] has to take a couple of big steps to the left to win, so I don't think she will," another former Senate Democratic leadership aide told Bloomberg BNA.

Part of the concern among Democratic strategists is Clinton venturing too far left on environmental issues and making herself less electable during the general election in November 2016.

"It just depends on how much pressure Sanders puts on Clinton," former Rep. Zachary Space (D-Ohio), now a principal at law firm Vorys Advisors LLC, told Bloomberg BNA. "If she has to turn her back on fossil fuels to cater to the left, she will pay a price in the general election."

Some Republicans told Bloomberg BNA they see Clinton moving too far left as a real possibility and would attempt to exploit it.

**Continue to Dodge.** Still, the overwhelming opinion of observers is that Clinton will successfully rebuff attempts from progressives in the party to shift leftward on a host of environmental and energy issues, even if she adopts more liberal positions on other topics.

"I think she'll continue to dodge," Robert McNally, president of the Rapidan Group, a Washington-based energy market and policy consulting firm, told Bloomberg BNA. "She'll take water for lots of reasons, but this I don't think will be one of the bigger ones."

Some Democrats see complications for Clinton if she tries to cater to the progressive wing of the party. They would prefer her to shrug off the pressure and not risk alienating white-collar Democratic voters who may not embrace some of these policies.

"There's no doubt Sanders and O'Malley are going to push her to the left, but she should just be herself," former Rep. Bart Stupak (D-Mich.), now a partner at law firm Venable LLP, told Bloomberg BNA. "Ignore Sanders and O'Malley. You've got to run your own race."

By ANTHONY ADRAGNA AND RACHEL LEVEN To contact the reporter on this story: Anthony Adragna and Rachel Leven in Washington at aadragna@bna.com and rleven@bna.com

To contact the editor responsible for this story: Larry Pearl at lpearl@bna.com

#### Elections

#### **Republican Nominee Likely to Shift Views On Climate in General Election, Observers Say**

**B** oth the eventual Democratic and Republican nominees for president will likely have to moderate their stances—at least rhetorically—on climate change and other environmental issues, though the majority of two-dozen election observers told Bloomberg BNA the Republican pick would likely have a longer walk back to the political center.

Many of the former congressmen, aides, academics and lobbyists told Bloomberg BNA it would be difficult for the Republican nominee to outright question the role of human activity in climate change—something many of the candidates have done in the primary though careful rhetorical changes could be enough to allay the concerns of the average U.S. voter.

"[Republicans] are going to have a long way to come back depending on who their nominee is," Chris Miller, former adviser to Sen. Harry Reid (D-Nev.) on environment issues, told Bloomberg BNA.

"Based on most all of the polling I've seen, if they want to capture the independents, they can't slam EPA, can't deny the science, they have to have some solutions," said Miller, now with the consulting firm AJW.

A Pew Research Center poll in June found 68 percent of the public believe the Earth's climate is changing, 45 percent believe that it is caused by human activity and 46 percent believe it is a very serious problem.

**Republican Shift.** In the Republican primary, candidate views on climate change range from denial to acknowledgement that it is occurring and has to be addressed. The candidates include front-runner Donald Trump, who has called global warming a "hoax."

To have a shot at winning the general election, however, the Republican nominee will have to at least acknowledge climate change and have potential solutions to address it, a former congressman, environmentalists and strategists from both parties said.

Mike McKenna, a Republican strategist, told Bloomberg BNA that he expected the candidate who emerged from the Republican primary to shift to the center on climate change, because denial of the problem would be a difficult position to hold in the general election.

McKenna pointed to the rhetorical shifts already undertaken by former Florida Gov. Jeb Bush, who has assumed the moderate stance of acknowledging the role of human activity in climate change while staunchly opposing actions by President Barack Obama to address it. Other candidates might stake out similar ground if they win the primary contest, he said.

A candidate who denies climate change altogether would leave the party at odds with many voters and face a steep climb to secure the presidency, they said.

"I don't think a Republican that denies the problem, thinks humans are not substantially responsible and opposes all mandatory control programs can be viable in the general election," former Rep. Frederick "Rick" Boucher (D-Va.) told Bloomberg BNA.

For a more moderate candidate, however, such as Jeb Bush (R) or Ohio Gov. John Kasich (R), the pivot would be possible, former congressional aides said. **Moderate Pivot Possible.** "Republicans maybe need to soften the tone a bit without upsetting the base," said Chris Vieson, a former staffer for then-House Majority Leader Eric Cantor (R-Va.). "That's a fine line to walk right there, but I think it's doable."

Oscar Ramirez, a principal at the Podesta Group, said the Republican nominee will have to acknowledge climate change and offer what he described as likely a watered-down plan.

"For Republicans, the question can't be whether or not they care about the issue," Ramirez said. "If the way the voters view it is that Democrats care about it and Republicans don't, that's a difficult position for Republicans to be in next year."

**Energy, Overreach Issues.** On issues of energy development and government overreach, however, there won't be much movement for the Republican nominee, several observers said.

These issues, such as whether to approve the Keystone XL pipeline, have been hashed out in Congress with recorded votes and the positions are generally established, former Sen. Kay Bailey Hutchison (R-Texas) told Bloomberg BNA.

"I think that the Republicans will be united and [their final stance will] be the same in the primary as in the general," said Hutchison, now senior counsel with the Bracewell & Giuliani LLP law firm in Dallas.

Many Democrats held that their nominee wouldn't have to pivot on climate change for the general election since many see the presumptive nominee Hillary Clinton's views as already moderate.

But according to Robert McNally, president of the Rapidan Group LLC, a consulting group, Clinton will likely hit Republicans on climate change and play it safe when it comes to energy issues.

The former secretary of state will likely avoid taking a position on issues such as crude oil exports and the Keystone XL pipeline for as long as possible, he said.

"She'll be downplaying the Clean Power Plan and how she'll decarbonize the economy," McNally said, referring to the Environmental Protection Agency's initiative that seeks to reduce carbon emissions from the power sector. "She'll soften her tone quite a bit."

Chris Warren, spokesman for the American Energy Alliance, questioned whether it was even possible for Clinton to be tenable in the general election. Clinton already is "pandering" to the "far left," he said.

At the end of the day, any shift to the center will likely be aimed at a very small portion of Independent voters who might switch their allegiances, Alan Abramowitz, a professor of political science at Emory College, told Bloomberg BNA.

"There's always that risk [someone could be pushed too far to one end of the political spectrum], but I would say these differences on environmental issues, like so many other issues, are already baked in the cake," Abramowitz said. "These parties, they're already aligned on these issues."

BY ANTHONY ADRAGNA AND RACHEL LEVEN To contact the reporters on this story: Anthony Adragna and Rachel Leven in Washington at aadragna@bna.com and rleven@bna.com

To contact the editor responsible for this story: Larry Pearl at lpearl@bna.com

Bloomberg BNA reporters Anthony Adragna and Rachel Leven asked each presidential candidate's campaign multiple times over a period of weeks to respond to the questions below. Where campaigns did not respond, Bloomberg BNA reviewed statements to determine the most accurate reflection of the candidate's position.



Is climate change occurring? If so, does human activity significantly contribute to it?



Should the Keystone XL pipeline be approved?



Do you support the renewable fuel standard (RFS)?



What role should renewable energies, including solar and wind, play in our domestic energy supply?



Do you support the EPA's Clean Power Plan? What should the next step be for states?



How do you view actions taken by President Barack Obama's EPA? Is that agency acting within its authority as envisioned by Congress?



Are there any other energy and environmental issues of particular concern in your campaign?

Note: Not all candidates were included in this graphic.



## Vermont Sen. Bernie Sanders (I)



Calls climate change the "greatest, most significant planetary environmental crisis facing the world,"



Leads Senate opposition to construction of the Keystone XL pipeline,



Says he needs to further study the issue of the RFS,



Has introduced legislation that would expand access to solar energy and speed deployment of other renewable sources,





Supports use of a carbon tax to combat climate change.



## Former Virginia Sen. Jim Webb (D)



Says climate change is real, but has opposed regulatory efforts to fight it,



Backs the Keystone XL pipeline,



Strongly backs coal and nuclear energy over renewable sources,



Says EPA regulations "clearly overflow the appropriate regulatory banks,"



Has backed offshore oil and gas exploration off Virginia coast.



## Former Secretary of State Hillary Clinton (D)



Believes aggressive action is needed to address climate change,



Declines to take a position on Keystone XL pipeline,



Aims to have the U.S. generate enough clean energy to power all American homes within 10 years of becoming president,



Supports and will protect the Clean Power Plan from any attempts to roll it back,



Has said that natural gas could, with appropriate safeguards, play important role in moving to cleaner energy economy.





## Former Maryland Gov. Martin O'Malley (D)



Says U.S. should be powered entirely by clean energy
within 35 years,



Calls for the U.S. to reject Keystone pipeline, argues it would worsen climate change,



Recently reaffirmed his support for RFS,



Vows to defend the EPA's Clean Power Plan against attempts to undermine it,



Supports new greenhouse gas regulations by the EPA.





## Former Florida Gov. Jeb Bush (R)



Tells Bloomberg BNA human activity has contributed to climate change, but says U.S. should be wary of solutions that could harm economy,



Calls approval of Keystone XL pipeline a "no-brainer,"



Supports phasing out of RFS "probably" by 2022,



Supports renewable energy sources, but rejects government mandates to use certain types,



Describes EPA's Clean Power Plan as "irresponsible and ineffective" and says it "oversteps state authority,"



Says EPA "seems intent on pushing its authority beyond legal limits."





## South Carolina Sen. Lindsey Graham (R)



Tells Bloomberg BNA that climate change is a "national and economic security" issue, as well as a moral one,



Supports construction of the Keystone XL pipeline,



Says RFS "has an important role to play" in expanding energy production and supports it,



Does not back Clean Power Plan and says Obama's "command-and-control approach to the environment and climate change is a disaster,"



Says the "EPA has repeatedly overstepped its bounds and needs to be reined in."





## Texas Sen. Ted Cruz (R)



Doesn't believe in climate change,



Supports approving the Keystone XL pipeline,



Has introduced a bill that would phase out and repeal the RFS over five years,



Has said the EPA's Clean Power Plan would "cripple the coal industry" and limit job creation,



Believes EPA regulators are "out of control."



## Wisconsin Gov. Scott Walker (R)



Supports Keystone XL pipeline,



Supports eventually phasing out the RFS,



Has said complying with the Clean Power Plan would make it difficult to keep Wisconsin electricity safe, reliable and affordable,



Has opposed EPA proposals, wants to shift regulatory authority to states and leave EPA as a mediator for state disputes.





## Louisiana Gov. Bobby Jindal (R)



Says human activity has had "some" impact on climate change but unsure of how much,



Wants immediate approval of Keystone XL pipeline,



Supports gradual phaseout of the renewable fuel standard,

Argues EPA regulations send message that U.S. "not a viable place for major, multiyear capital investments,"



Voices support for developing "any and all methods of producing energy," including wind and solar.



## m

## Former Arkansas Gov. Mike Huckabee (R)



Says science of climate change "not as settled" as it is on other things,



Strongly supports Keystone XL pipeline construction,



Recently reaffirmed support for RFS,



Voiced support for utilizing renewable energy sources like solar and wind,



Has warned EPA regulations will "bankrupt families."



## Florida Sen. Marco Rubio (R)



Disputes notion that human activity significantly contributes to climate change,



Strongly supports approving Keystone XL pipeline,



Supports phaseout of RFS,



Opposes Clean Power Plan and calls rule "Obama's job-killing EPA overreach,"



Says "of course" solar and wind should be part of national energy mix.





## **Businesswoman Carly Fiorina (R)**



Does not dispute scientific consensus that human activity significantly contributes to climate change,



Supports building the Keystone XL pipeline,



Has indicated support for phasing out the RFS,



On climate, says "the answer to this problem is innovation, not regulation,"



Calls California's drought a "man-made disaster" fueled by burdensome regulations.





## Former New York Gov. George Pataki (R)



Tells Bloomberg BNA that he believes the climate is changing, but is not sure of the extent that human activity is causing it,



Opposes the RFS,

Supports Keystone XL pipeline,



Believes renewable energy is important to have in domestic portfolio,



Opposes the Clean Power Plan,



Believes the EPA has "far-outstripped its statutory authority" by not adequately considering costs to the economy and benefits of regulations,



Would continue focus from when he was governor on issues such as open space protection.



## m

## Former Pennsylvania Sen. Rick Santorum (R)



Tells Bloomberg BNA that the climate has always been changing and questions what to do about it,



Supports Keystone XL pipeline approval,



Supports the RFS,



Believes we need an all-of-the-above energy strategy,



Believes the EPA is "out of control" and would repeal all "job-killing," Obama administration regulations on day one as president,



Wants to boost economy through rebuilding American manufacturing and energy supply, with cost consideration playing "crucial role" in plan.



n

**Businessman Donald Trump (R)** 

Believes the concept of climate change is a hoax,



Supports the construction of the Keystone XL pipeline,



Has called wind energy "obsolete."



## Former Texas Gov. Rick Perry (R)





Supports the Keystone XL pipeline,



Touts Texas's achievement of being nation's largest wind energy producer,



Opposes the Clean Power Plan.





## **Retired neurosurgeon Dr. Ben Carson (R)**



Disputes scientific consensus on climate change: "We may be warming. We may be cooling,"



Supports Keystone XL pipeline construction as "perfectly safe,"



Favors ending oil industry subsidies and putting savings into ethanol industry,



Says EPA should "be told to work in conjunction with businesses, industry and universities" on how best to develop energy resources.





## **Ohio Gov. John Kasich (R)**



Recognizes that climate change is occurring, but isn't sure about the causes or underlying science,



Supports the Keystone XL pipeline project,



Signed a bill to delay renewable energy mandates in Ohio,



Kasich administration told federal EPA that Clean Power



## New Jersey Gov. Chris Christie (R)



Believes global warming is real and that human activity is part of the problem,



Supports building the Keystone XL pipeline,



Supports the RFS,



Signed into law legislation to boost offshore wind farm development, but some have questioned whether his position has shifted.





## Kentucky Sen. Rand Paul (R)



Backed an amendment saying human activity contributes to climate change,



Supports the Keystone XL pipeline project,







Wants to rein in government overreach.



Plan is unworkable and illegal.



#### DEMOCRATS

#### HILLARY CLINTON

## **Clinton Aims to Make U.S. Clean Energy Super Power, Address Warming Quickly**

illary Clinton, the presumptive favorite for the Democratic presidential nomination in 2016, would address climate change and energy challenges in part by boosting domestic clean energy availability and use, according to the first installment of her climate policy plan.

Her plan offers the first glimpse into how Clinton's actions as president would compare to her record on environmental protection and action on climate change.

The first portion of Clinton's plan leaves several key questions unanswered, and more than a dozen environmental groups, energy industry lobbyists and other groups told Bloomberg BNA that they will be pressing her campaign for the answers.

Clinton announced her candidacy for president April 12. Her campaign didn't respond to messages requesting comment.

**Boost for Solar.** A Clinton administration would work to install more than half a billion solar panels domestically within her first term in office and generate enough clean energy to power all American homes within 10 years, according to her plan.

Implementing the Environmental Protection Agency's Clean Power Plan, a rule that would set individual emissions rates for each state's power sector, would help accomplish this, Clinton's plan states.

The former first lady also would launch a Clean Energy Challenge through federal agencies, states and municipalities to improve clean energy while reducing carbon pollution.

Her campaign said "over the coming months" it will release strategies on how to address energy and climate security, modernize infrastructure, produce fossil fuels responsibly, protect coal communities, and conserve lands, waters and wildlife.

**Recent Comments.** Recent comments also reflect Clinton's environmental priorities.

At the League of Conservation Voters annual dinner in December 2014, Clinton called a fall 2014 international agreement with China to reduce carbon pollution, a revised national ozone standard and a \$3 billion pledge from the U.S. to the Green Climate Fund "just the beginning of what's needed."

In her remarks, Clinton said natural gas could play an "important bridge role in the transition to a cleaner energy economy" with proper safeguards. She also called for regulation of oil and gas operations' methane emissions.

Clinton's comments on hydraulic fracturing and previous comments on trade and offshore oil and gas drilling raised red flags for some environmental groups. They also expressed uneasiness over several undefined key policy stances. For example, Clinton has not taken a stand on the Keystone XL pipeline.

Other environmental advocates point to Clinton's hiring of John Podesta, who previously served as President Barack Obama's senior counselor on environmental issues, as evidence of her ongoing commitment to environmental issues.

**Stand Up to Big Oil.** Karthik Ganapathy, a spokesman for the anti-Keystone group 350 Action, told Bloomberg BNA that his group isn't sure Clinton will "stand up to Big Oil." Clinton said July 28 that she wouldn't comment on the pipeline until the Obama administration makes a decision.

Industry groups largely refrained from commenting on Clinton, although several said she would have to defend EPA regulations of the Obama administration and would be unable to distance herself from the president's policy positions.

The American Coalition for Clean Coal Electricity, a coal advocacy group, expressed hope that Clinton would favor the use of coal internationally because she has said coal is critical to ending energy poverty. Laura Sheehan, a spokeswoman for the group, told Bloomberg BNA that it was too early to understand Clinton's views on coal.

Many environmental groups said Clinton has built a strong record of environmental leadership throughout her time as secretary of state, from 2009 through 2013, and as a senator from New York from 2001 through 2009.

**Strong Record.** Groups pointed to Clinton's decision in 2012 for the U.S. to join a coalition to reduce short-lived climate pollutants such as methane, black carbon and hydrofluorocarbons as especially significant.

They also mentioned her work during international climate talks in Copenhagen in 2009, where Clinton unveiled plans for a \$100 billion-a-year Green Climate Fund underwritten by private and public sources to help developing nations adapt to the impacts of climate change.

"She has given no indication she's going to back away from these issues," Heather Taylor-Miesle, director of the NRDC Action Fund, told Bloomberg BNA.

Clinton's climate and energy plan in 2007 for her previous run for the White House aimed to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 80 percent from 1990 levels by 2050, cut foreign oil imports by two-thirds from projected levels by 2030 and create at least 5 million jobs from clean energy during the next decade. It would have included a cap-and-trade program to auction greenhouse gas permits.

#### **BERNIE SANDERS**

## Sanders Pushes for Strong Climate Action, Highlights Differences With Clinton

en. Bernie Sanders (I-Vt.), a self-described democratic socialist, has spoken forcefully about the need to accelerate efforts to address the impacts of human-caused climate change and has repeatedly pushed the U.S. to transition its energy mix from fossil fuels to cleaner energy sources.

Though still expected to face long odds against Democratic frontrunner Hillary Clinton for the party nomination, Sanders has drawn large crowds with his progressive message on issues such as climate change, trade and income inequality.

"Climate change is the greatest, most significant planetary environmental crisis facing the world," Sanders told Bloomberg BNA while considering a run in September 2014. "It has got to be addressed."

Sanders, the longest-serving Independent in congressional history, boasts a lifetime score of 95 percent from the League of Conservation Voters and has pushed long-shot legislation to address climate change during several sessions of Congress. His campaign did not respond to further requests for comment.

Although many environmental groups have backed Clinton for the Democratic nomination, others have questioned her environmental bona fides given her positions on issues such as the Keystone XL pipeline, hydraulic fracturing and offshore oil and gas drilling. They said those doubts about Clinton's true environmental commitment have opened the door to more progressive candidates like Sanders.

The Vermont senator has called for the rejection of the proposed Keystone XL pipeline, advocated for stronger regulations governing fracking operations and opposed any new offshore oil and gas drilling operations. He has declined to answer questions on the renewable fuel standard, saying he needs more time to study the issue.

**Already Focus of Campaign.** Climate change has been one of the major issues emphasized by Sanders since announcing his campaign in April, and he has used his stances on issues such as the Keystone XL pipeline to highlight differences with Clinton.

"I have helped lead the opposition against the Keystone pipeline," the Vermont senator said July 14. "I think Secretary Clinton has not been clear on her views on that issue."

Sanders has also said he "very strongly" agrees with Pope Francis that climate change represents a "great planetary crisis."

"He makes me very conservative on economic issues, and that he spoke on climate change in as forceful a manner as he did is just extraordinary," Sanders said on the HBO program "Real Time with Bill Maher" in June. "I think the fact that the pope has spoken out will have a profound impact all over this world."

Sanders previously told Bloomberg BNA he plans to lay out significant policy proposals to speed the adoption of energy efficiency, weatherization and sustainable energy, but he has not done so to date. He wrote broadly of the need to address climate change on his campaign website.

"We must transform our energy system away from polluting fossil fuels, and towards energy efficiency and sustainability," the website states. "Millions of homes and buildings need to be weatherized, and we need to greatly accelerate technological progress in wind and solar power generation."

In early July, Sanders unveiled a solar initiative program that he said would make renewable energy more affordable for low-income families. The Low Income Solar Act (S. 1713) would provide \$200 million in loans to help offset the initial costs of solar arrays on community facilities, public housing and low-income family homes.

**Critic of Republicans.** Since joining the Senate in 2007, Sanders has repeatedly slammed Republicans in Congress for refusing to acknowledge the scientific consensus that human activity significantly contributes to climate change and for their refusal to consider comprehensive legislation to address the problem.

"If you ask me—and I already deal with a lot of issues out there—my greatest embarrassment of being a member of the United States Congress right now, it is that you have a major political party, the Republican Party, who refuses to listen to what the scientists are saying," Sanders said in March 2013. "The scientific community is almost 100 percent united in saying global warming is real, that global warming is significantly caused by man-made activities, that global warming is already causing serious damage to our country and to the world and that it will only get worse."

Earlier in 2015, during debate on the proposed Keystone XL pipeline, Sanders pushed for a vote on a sense of the Senate amendment stating that climate change is "real" and "caused by human activities."

The text of Sanders's amendment further said climate change had "already caused devastating problems" around the world and stated "a brief window of opportunity" exists to address the issue. The Senate ultimately tabled the amendment.

In Congress, Sanders has repeatedly introduced legislation to put a price on carbon pollution, despite the long odds such efforts face. In 2014, for example, Sanders and Sen. Barbara Boxer (D-Calif.) introduced the Climate Protection Act of 2013.

#### MARTIN O'MALLEY

## O'Malley's Detailed Climate Plan, State Record Draw Praise From Advocates

ormer Maryland Gov. Martin O'Malley (D) has unveiled the most detailed plan for any Democratic candidate on how to address climate change and said making the U.S. run entirely on clean energy by 2050 would be his number one priority if elected president.

In a white paper, O'Malley said he would take a series of executive actions to build on the Obama administration's Climate Action Plan. Those include:

• ordering the Environmental Protection Agency to develop greenhouse gas regulations for other large emitters beyond power plants,

■ retrofitting federal buildings and the federal vehicle fleet to the highest efficiency standards,

■ adopting a zero-tolerance policy for methane leaks from existing oil and gas infrastructure,

■ rejecting offshore drilling and infrastructure projects like the proposed Keystone XL crude oil pipeline, and

• creating a Clean Energy Jobs Corps to improve energy efficiency in buildings, boost local resiliency, create new green spaces and grow the nation's forests.

"We cannot meet the climate challenge with an all-ofthe-above energy strategy, or by drilling off our coasts, or by building pipelines that bring oil from tar sands in Canada," O'Malley wrote in a June 18 op-ed article in USA Today announcing his platform. "I believe, within 35 years, our country can, and should, be 100% powered by clean energy, supported by millions of new jobs."

**Local Record Hailed.** O'Malley, who was Maryland governor from 2007 through 2015, set aggressive water quality standards to improve the health of the Chesapeake Bay, aggressively expanded renewable energy development, created a state commission to respond to climate change and set the goal of reducing state greenhouse gas emissions 25 percent below 2006 levels by 2020.

O'Malley has also boosted his national environmental bona fides by opposing completion of the proposed Keystone XL pipeline, condemning a decision by the Obama administration to allow oil and gas drilling off the Atlantic Coast and by voicing strong support for the EPA's carbon pollution rules for power plants.

However, a few of his stances leave environmental advocates uneasy. O'Malley declined to get involved with plans to export liquefied natural gas from the Cove Point facility in Maryland and allowed plans for hydraulic fracturing operations to go forward in the state, albeit with some of the strictest standards nationally. Overall, though, environmental advocates have praised O'Malley for his clear stances on many of their priority issues, including limits on the extraction of new fossil fuel sources.

**Energy Issues.** For example, O'Malley called the Obama administration's decision to permit some oil and gas drilling off the Atlantic Coast a "big mistake."

On Keystone, the Maryland governor urged the Senate in fall 2014 to vote down legislation to immediately approve the project and said the proposed pipeline was irreconcilable with the need to address climate change.

O'Malley has also thrown his support behind the EPA's plan to reduce carbon dioxide emissions from the nation's power plants and said in a September 2013 statement the regulations would help address the "moral" issue of climate change.

**Praise for Platform.** O'Malley's announced platform drew strong praise from environmental advocates for its "creative uses of executive authority," and groups told Bloomberg BNA it would place "enormous pressure" on Democratic frontrunner Hillary Clinton to put forward as specific and substantive a platform for addressing the problem.

"There are a lot of votes that you're going to leave on the table if you don't come up with a real solution to the climate change problem," Karthik Ganapathy, communications manager for 350.org, told Bloomberg BNA. "That's just an electoral risk that people can't afford to take. It's noteworthy and heartening to see a candidate of this caliber come out with such an ambitious and forward-thinking agenda."

Advocates have faulted Clinton for her lack of specifics on how to address climate change and for her lack of concrete positions on issues ranging from hydraulic fracturing to Keystone. O'Malley and Sen. Bernie Sanders (I-Vt.) are expected to push Clinton leftward on environmental issues.

Daniel J. Weiss of the League of Conservation Voters Action Fund, who in April praised Clinton's "strong record of leadership in support of public health safeguards and climate pollution reductions," also told Bloomberg BNA the group hoped the plan would generate debate among all presidential candidates.

**Critics Slam 'Pie-in-the-Sky.'** Fossil fuel groups slammed O'Malley's proposal as hopelessly naive and said the U.S. would continue to rely on traditional energy sources to supply electricity.

"It's disappointing Gov. O'Malley is proposing pie-inthe-sky policies that ignore the economic realities facing millions of hardworking Americans," Laura Sheehan, a spokeswoman for the American Coalition for Clean Coal Electricity, told Bloomberg BNA.

#### DEMOCRATS

#### JIM WEBB

#### Webb Remembered as Frequent Thorn in Democrats' Side on Climate Issues

ormer one-term Sen. Jim Webb (D-Va.), known for resisting efforts in his party to take action on climate change and for his strong support of the coal industry, launched what he acknowledged is a longodds bid for the presidency on July 2 and will present a contrast with the rest of the Democratic field on environmental issues.

Webb, who served in the Senate from 2007 until 2013, once cautioned President Barack Obama on negotiating an international agreement on climate change, refused to back draft cap-and-trade legislation in 2009 and consistently resisted efforts from the Environmental Protection Agency to regulate greenhouse gas emissions under the Clean Air Act.

"I am not convinced the Clean Air Act was ever intended to regulate or classify as a dangerous pollutant something as basic and ubiquitous in our atmosphere as carbon dioxide," Webb said on the Senate floor in 2011. "The sweeping actions that the EPA proposes to undertake clearly overflow the appropriate regulatory banks established by Congress, with the potential to affect every aspect of the American economy."

While such comments place Webb firmly at odds with the rest of the Democratic primary field, the former senator does boast a respectable 81 percent lifetime score from the League of Conservation Voters and has acknowledged human activity contributes to climate change.

During his time in the Senate, Webb repeatedly supported efforts to delay the EPA from regulating carbon dioxide pollution from power plants. In 2011, for example, he supported legislation from then-Sen. Jay Rockefeller (D-W.Va.) to halt EPA regulation of greenhouse gases from stationary sources for two years.

Webb also supported construction of the proposed Keystone XL oil pipeline, backed drilling projects off of Virginia's coast and described an Obama administration moratorium on new offshore oil drilling following the BP oil spill as an overreaction.

#### LINCOLN CHAFEE

## **Chafee Signed Climate Bill as Governor, Helped Block Clean Air Act Rewrite**

ormer Rhode Island Gov. Lincoln Chafee (D) aligns closely with the policy stances of other Democratic presidential contenders by backing action on climate change and supporting carbon pollution rules for power plants, but he is thought to face long odds in his bid to secure his party's nomination.

Chafee, who entered the race June 3, signed legislation in 2014 requiring Rhode Island to slash its greenhouse gas emissions by 80 percent by 2050. That year, he also set up the Rhode Island Executive Climate Change Council in hopes of preparing his state to address the impacts of climate change.

"I am establishing the council because for too long there has been strong evidence and scientific consensus that man-made greenhouse gases will have profound effects on global climate, weather patterns and ocean conditions," Chafee said in a statement. "Rhode Island must act boldly."

During his official campaign launch in June, the Rhode Island Democrat said, "We can address climate change and extreme weather while protecting American jobs." "Governor Chafee has a long record on environmental protection and preserving open space," a campaign spokeswoman told Bloomberg BNA.

Chafee's campaign faces major disadvantages. He reported raising just \$30,000 in support of his presidential bid during the second quarter of 2015 and has consistently polled below 1 percent, trailing Democratic contenders Hillary Clinton, Sen. Bernie Sanders (I-Vt.) and former Maryland Gov. Martin O'Malley.

Prior to becoming Rhode Island governor, Chafee served two terms in the U.S. Senate as a Republican, where he received a lifetime score of 78 percent from the League of Conservation Voters. He was then a registered Independent from 2007 until 2013.

In March 2005, Chafee cast the deciding vote blocking a George W. Bush administration-backed bill to change Clean Air Act rules for power plants.

Chafee voted to block the Clear Skies Act from advancing in the Senate. The bill would have used emissions trading to reduce power plant emissions of nitrogen oxides, sulfur dioxide and mercury.

#### JEB BUSH

## Bush Acknowledges Human Role in Climate Change, Pushes Innovation as Solution

ormer Florida Gov. Jeb Bush (R) acknowledges human activity has contributed to climate change but cautions that solutions to address the problem should be carefully crafted to avoid significant harm to the U.S. economy.

"I think we have a responsibility to adapt to what the possibilities are without destroying our economy, without hollowing out our industrial core," Bush told Bloomberg BNA in a July 28 e-mailed statement. "I think it's appropriate to recognize this and invest in the proper research to find solutions over the long haul but not be alarmists about it. We should not say the end is near, not deindustrialize the country, not create barriers for higher growth not just totally obliterate family budgets."

Bush, who served as governor of the Sunshine State from 1999 through 2007, largely opposed oil and gas drilling off the coast of Florida, secured billions to restore the Everglades and led a \$1 billion public land acquisition program during his time running the state.

Since leaving the office, Bush has voiced strong support for the proposed Keystone XL pipeline, expressed support for hydraulic fracturing and backed the gradual phaseout of the renewable fuel standard.

Jeb Bush, who declared his candidacy June 15, is the son of former President George H.W. Bush and the brother of former President George W. Bush.

**Condemns Clean Power Plan.** Bush also told Bloomberg BNA the Environmental Protection Agency's carbon pollution rules for the nation's power plants were "irresponsible and ineffective."

"First, it does virtually nothing to address the risk of climate change," Bush said of the proposed Clean Power Plan. "Second, it oversteps state authority. Third, EPA has gone far beyond its statutory authority, regulating how people consume energy. Fourth, it threatens the reliability of the electricity grid."

President Barack Obama's EPA "seems intent on pushing its authority beyond legal limits," according to Bush, who said he would "change that" if elected president in 2016.

Among many observers though, Republican and Democrat, Bush has shifted stances so frequently that it is nearly impossible to identify what he actually believes.

"The Bush family is really, really good at muddying the waters," Mike McKenna, a Republican lobbyist and strategist, told Bloomberg BNA. "So at the end of the day, you're not really sure what this guy is or is not for."

Environmental advocates now say Bush is in many ways worse than outright climate change deniers, because the groups aren't sure what he actually believes. "Until he comes out with a vision to address America's real serious problems like climate change, he can't be taken seriously," Heather Taylor-Miesle, director of the NRDC Action Fund, told Bloomberg BNA.

**Mainstream on Keystone, Fracking.** Bush voiced strong support for minimal government regulation of hydraulic fracturing during a late January speech and indicated strong support for the "veritable [energy] revolution."

"Washington shouldn't try to regulate hydraulic fracking out of business," Bush told the National Automobile Dealers Association Convention in San Francisco. "It should be done reasonably and thoughtfully to protect the natural environment, but it shouldn't be done with the intent of paralyzing it."

Bush also said approving the Keystone pipeline was a "no-brainer."

In contrast to some high-profile environmental issues, Bush has distanced himself from others in the Republican race by voicing support for ultimately phasing out the renewable fuel standard.

"I do think that phasing out, getting to a place where we don't pick winners and losers and we don't create mandates, over time, is the proper thing to do," Bush said.

Bush said he favors using as diverse an energy mix including wind, solar, other renewables, nuclear, natural gas and coal—as possible to meet the energy needs but added he did not support the government dictating what should be utilized.

"Power generation should reflect, as much as possible, the diverse attributes and needs of states and their citizens," Bush said. "The federal government should not be dictating what types of power should be used where. It should not be picking winners and losers."

**Record as Governor.** Some point to Bush's record as Florida governor as reason to hope he would bring a moderate approach to environmental issues as president.

During his time in Tallahassee, Bush secured and spent billions to restore the Everglades.

"I remain fully committed to restoring the water quality of the Everglades at the earliest possible date, and to protecting the valuable partnership of state and federal government required to complete the restoration of this national treasure," Bush said in a 2003 statement.

In 2001, Jeb Bush urged the Interior Department to halt a proposed lease of some 6 million acres off the state's northwestern coast and continue offshore drilling in the eastern Gulf of Mexico. He did later express qualified support for some offshore drilling in Florida and has strongly supported onshore drilling efforts.

#### SCOTT WALKER

## New Mediator Role for Federal EPA, Keystone Nod on Walker's Presidential Agenda

isconsin Gov. Scott Walker (R), who entered the Republican race July 13, has largely refrained from wading into the climate change debate but has stated clearly that the responsibilities of the nation's environment regulator should be shifted to the states.

In many ways, Walker's views on national environment and energy policies, such as his concerns over the Environmental Protection Agency's Clean Power Plan, his opposition to a new national ground-level ozone standard and his support for broad energy development, mirror those of other Republican contenders.

However, the two-term governor's state record alone, including his signature on a recent state budget that restricted protections for water, is enough to prompt vehement opposition from environmentalists.

"He views himself on a national stage in front of exactly two people: the Koch brothers," Heather Taylor-Miesle, director of the NRDC Action Fund, told Bloomberg BNA, referring to wealthy industrialists Charles and David Koch. "That makes him dangerous."

Walker's campaign did not respond to multiple requests for comment.

**Climate Change.** Walker has made few comments about his stance on climate change, though he did say July 24 that it shouldn't be the top security issue, according to the Guardian.

On major federal environmental regulations, Walker has been an adversary of the EPA.

Walker told President Barack Obama in May that complying with the EPA's proposed Clean Power Plan, a rule that would set state-specific carbon dioxide emissions rates, would make it difficult to keep electricity in Wisconsin "safe, affordable and reliable." The Wisconsin governor stopped short of saying the state wouldn't comply with the regulation once finalized.

Additionally, Walker has opposed the EPA's November 2014 proposal to lower national standards for ground-level ozone that are currently set at 75 parts per billion.

Such stances on controversial federal regulations have earned Walker rave reviews from industry groups. They also mean he likely won't look to those issues as a way to distinguish himself from the rest of the Republican field, several Republican strategists told Bloomberg BNA.

Mike McKenna, a Republican lobbyist and strategist, told Bloomberg BNA that Walker could be more "precise" and "nuanced" in his views during the primary race, rather than focus on "EPA bashing as a way to bolster [his] bona fides."

**Renewable Fuel Standard.** On another high-profile issue, Walker supports—but wants to eventually phase out—the EPA's renewable fuel standard. Some allege this is a change from Walker's previous views on the requirement to blend biofuels such as ethanol into the fuel supply, but his campaign disputed that in March.

Ford O'Connell, a Republican strategist who advised Sen. John McCain (R-Ariz.) on energy issues during his 2008 presidential run, told Bloomberg BNA the nuanced shift from Walker on ethanol issues likely stemmed from the fact the Wisconsin governor feels he needs to win the Iowa caucuses to remain competitive.

More broadly, Walker opposes the EPA's current national regulatory role. Walker told the Washington Examiner in a July 27 interview that as president he would shift the EPA's responsibilities to the states, leaving the federal agency as an "umbrella organization" that mediates disputes between states.

"I'm all for a sustainable environment, but you have to balance it with a sustainable economy, and I think in our state we've shown you can do that hand-in-hand," Walker said.

**Energy Development.** But in the largest energy and environment issue for the Republican race—energy development— Walker appears to have fallen in line with his party's other presidential hopefuls.

Walker said at July 28 campaign event that the U.S. should increase natural gas drilling, according to local reports. He separately said the Keystone XL pipeline should be approved.

**State Record.** Walker's state record also provides insight into his views on energy and the environment.

Walker is also known for signing into law in March 2013 legislation that would speed up permitting and relax environmental protections for ferrous metallic mining, a law environmental groups strongly opposed. The legislation was largely expected to apply to a \$1.5 billion proposed open-pit iron mine by Gogebic Taconite LLC that the company later declared "unfeasible" due to interactions with the federal EPA.

Walker's environmental record during his time as governor shows he would be a "disaster" as president on those issues, Kerry Schumann, executive director of the Wisconsin League of Conservation Voters, told Bloomberg BNA.

"We've never seen anything like this," Schumann said.

#### DONALD TRUMP

## **Trump Alleges Global Warming Conspiracy, Backs Keystone Pipeline**

**D** onald Trump, the business titan who has called global warming a "hoax" and "bullshit," has staked out a position as one of the least environmentally friendly Republicans in the 2016 primary.

Trump has indicated that he supports the Keystone XL pipeline and broadening energy development, called wind farms "obsolete" and hasn't taken a stance on renewable fuel use. His environment opinions are less clear than some other Republican contenders, due in part to his lack of executive or legislative experience.

While Trump, who announced his candidacy for president on June 16, has been considered a long-shot candidate for the Republican presidential nomination, according to a July 26 CNN poll, he has led the party pack with 18 percent of Republicans supporting him.

The Trump campaign didn't respond to several messages from Bloomberg BNA requesting comment.

The business mogul is perhaps best known on environmental issues for his stance on climate change and his corresponding conspiracy theories. Trump has insinuated that the occurrence of freezing temperatures disproves global warming and that those who agree with the scientific views on climate change don't believe what they're saying. One theory by the former television star alleges that the Chinese created the concept "to make U.S. manufacturing noncompetitive."

Like most of his fellow Republicans, Trump has indicated support for building the Keystone XL pipeline, a method of horizontal drilling known as hydraulic fracturing and increased domestic fossil fuel development.

Overall, he has provided few specifics. A federal disclosure form shows that he has invested \$250,000 in TransCanada Corp., the company that seeks to build the Keystone pipeline, according to reports.

Trump also has expressed open disdain for wind energy. "Windmills are destroying every country they touch—and the energy is unreliable and terrible," he tweeted in 2012.

#### **RICK PERRY**

#### **Climate Change Denier Perry Touts Wind, Clean Air Successes**

ormer Texas Gov. Rick Perry, who announced June 4 that he was running for president, has denied climate change is occurring and opposes the Environmental Protection Agency's landmark Clean Power Plan, but simultaneously touts his states' renewable energy and air quality improvement successes.

Perry, who led the Lone Star State between 2000 and 2015, said during his last presidential campaign in 2011 that he was "not afraid" to be labeled a climate change denier and has compared himself to 16th century astronomer Galileo, who argued the Earth revolved around the sun when fellow scientists argued the Earth was the center of the universe.

"Just because you have a group of scientists who stood up and said here is the fact," Perry said during a Republican debate. "Galileo got outvoted for a spell."

The Texas Republican also has denied that scientists overwhelmingly agree about the causes of climate change. He has said that any attempt to curtail coal use would "strangle our economy" and there is a much greater threat posed by "Iran changing the temperature of New York"—an allusion to a nuclear attack—than by climate change.

"Calling [carbon dioxide] a pollutant is doing a disservice to the country, and I believe a disservice to the world," Perry said in June 2014 Christian Science Monitor event.

But these beliefs haven't stopped Perry from touting clean energy and air quality achievements, according to his campaign website. During Perry's tenure as governor, Texas became—if it were ranked as a country—the sixth-largest wind energy producer in the world, it said.

The former governor also highlights on his website his state's ozone reduction success between 2000 and 2012, when ozone in Texas decreased 24 percent.

In addition, Perry said during his announcement for president that he would approve the construction of the Keystone XL pipeline and authorize natural gas and oil exports on day one if he became president.

#### **MIKE HUCKABEE**

## Huckabee Toes Party Line on Energy Issues, Thinks Climate Science Unsettled

ormer Arkansas Gov. Mike Huckabee (R) does not think the science behind climate change is settled and backs an energy policy that aligns closely with most other candidates in his party.

Huckabee, governor from 1996 through 2007, appeared to voice support for a cap-and-trade system for reducing harmful emissions in 2007, but then reversed himself several years later and denied making such remarks.

On his campaign website, the former governor backs expanding offshore oil and gas exploration, constructing the Keystone XL pipeline and using renewable energy sources such as wind and solar.

"Partisan politics has kept us from Arctic exploration, energy opportunities along the Outer Continental Shelf, building the Keystone pipeline, and new sources of natural gas," Huckabee's website states. "Wind, solar, and renewable energy have great potential, occur naturally, and flow from inexhaustible sources."

The Arkansan, who entered the race in late May, also has recently reaffirmed his support for the renewable fuel standard, which established the requirement to blend ethanol and other biofuels into the gasoline supply.

**Critical on Climate.** Though he previously supported action to address climate change, Huckabee in recent years has wavered on the role of human beings in creating the problem.

"I think the climate's been changing over the entire history of the Earth," Huckabee said during a July 28 interview with Yahoo!, adding he thought it was an "issue for scientists to talk about."

Asked about whether human activity contributed to the problem, Huckabee said it "probably does but a volcano in one blast will contribute more than 100 years of human activity." That theory has been roundly discredited in the scientific community.

During a May interview with NBC's "Meet the Press," Huckabee said that "science is not as settled on [climate change] as is it on some things." That view also is unsupported. Nearly all climate scientists have long agreed that the current climate changes are triggered by human activity.

Huckabee slammed President Barack Obama for saying that "no challenge poses a greater threat to future generations" than climate change. Huckabee said that the risks of climate change pale in comparison to those of terrorism.

"Not to diminish anything about the climate at all, but Mr. President, I believe that most of us would think that a beheading is a far greater threat to an American than a sunburn," Huckabee told the Iowa Freedom Summit in January, referring to beheadings carried out by the Islamic State group.

Back in 2007, Huckabee appeared to voice support for a cap-and-trade system and spoke of the responsibility humans have for protecting the Earth from the impacts of climate change.

"One thing that all of us have a responsibility to do is recognize that climate change is here, it's real," Huckabee told the Clean Air Cool Planet conference in November 2007. "What we have to do is quit pointing fingers as to who's at fault and recognize that it's all our fault and it's all our responsibility to fix it."

Later that year, Huckabee went further and said the U.S. should begin to transition away from fossil fuels in the coming years.

"We ought to be moving rapidly towards energy sources that don't have a greenhouse gas effect," Huckabee said, according to the Denver Post. "Aggressively set the goal that within a 10-year period, we should move away from a fossil fuel culture to one that has alternative energy resources."

**Apparent Reversal.** Three years later, Huckabee denied ever backing any form of cap-and-trade and said that such an approach would have been a "job killer."

#### I believe that most of us would think that a

#### beheading is a far greater threat to an American

#### than a sunburn.

—Former Gov. Mike Huckabee (Ark.)

"This kind of mandatory energy policy would have a horrible impact on this nation's job market," Huckabee said. "I never did support and never would support it period."

Huckabee in a March 2012 interview said that EPA regulations on greenhouse gas emissions would "bank-rupt families."

"[President Obama] champions himself as the, you know, the guy that loves the little guy," Huckabee said. "He is killing the little guy with these policies."

Though Huckabee's brand of conservative ideology gained traction in 2008—he won the Iowa's Republican caucuses—observers said the challenge for the former governor will be building momentum for a second run.

His campaign did not respond to requests for comment.

#### TED CRUZ

## **Energy Proponent Cruz Opposes Environment Regulations, Renewable Fuel Mandate**

D uring the course of his first two years in office, Sen. Ted Cruz (R-Texas) has called administrators at the Environmental Protection Agency "locusts," compared himself to Galileo for refusing to acknowledge the role of human activity in climate change and sponsored legislation to block the federal government from regulating pollution.

Cruz, the junior senator from Texas, was the first Republican to announce that he would seek the presidency in 2016. Lobbyists and other observers told Bloomberg BNA that Cruz would continue to loudly decry EPA regulations and efforts from President Barack Obama's administration to address climate change as he seeks to portray himself as the most conservative Republican running for president.

Several political observers said Cruz impressed many Republicans by refusing to budge on his criticism of the renewable fuel standard before an Iowa agricultural summit in March, despite the group's strong support for the program. The Texas Republican said the government should not pick "winners and losers" in its energy policy.

Cruz announced his candidacy March 23. His campaign didn't respond to messages from Bloomberg BNA requesting comment.

**Energy 'Wish List.'** Perhaps the clearest sign of his energy and environmental priorities comes in the form of a wish list of policies—the American Energy Renaissance Act (S. 791)—Cruz introduced in 2014 and again this year.

The bill would prevent the federal government from regulating hydraulic fracturing, bar federal agencies from regulating greenhouse gases, phase out and repeal the renewable fuel standard over five years, immediately approve the proposed Keystone XL pipeline, and require congressional approval for EPA regulations that would result in negative employment, among other provisions.

Notably, Cruz has said "unnecessary and unconstitutional" agencies—naming the Energy Department should be eliminated, according to a 2012 Houston Chronicle report.

Bills that Cruz has co-sponsored indicate a broad interest in limiting EPA authority that generally lines up with other Republican presidential candidates.

**'Out of Control' EPA.** Cruz has condemned specific regulatory actions from the Obama administration and said in February that stopping "the out-of-control regu-

lators at the EPA and the alphabet soup of Washington" are top items on his agenda.

In June 2014, Cruz said the EPA's proposed carbon dioxide emissions limits for existing power plants would "cripple the coal industry" and limit job creation. In October 2014, Cruz and Sen. John Barrasso (R-Wyo.) led a group of Senate Republicans urging the Obama administration to withdraw a rule that would clarify which waters and wetlands fall under the protection of the Clean Water Act.

Energy lobbyists said Cruz will likely continue to criticize what they describe as burdensome environmental regulations from the EPA and other federal agencies, because that rhetoric resonates with Republican primary voters.

Expect Cruz to continue to "throw rocks" at the EPA and to stick to "pretty standard" criticisms of the federal government's role in the energy industry, Michael McKenna, a Republican lobbyist and strategist, told Bloomberg BNA.

One favor the Texas Republican did himself was maintaining his criticism of the renewable fuel standard during an agricultural summit in Iowa. Other candidates—such as Govs. Scott Walker (R-Wis.) and Chris Christie (R-N.J.)—were perceived as doing poorly during that forum because they appeared to posture to the crowd, several energy industry lobbyists said.

"Cruz has really separated himself from the field on the ethanol mandate," Chris Warren, spokesman for the nonprofit American Energy Alliance, told Bloomberg BNA.

**Denies Human Contribution to Climate Change.** Another area where observers expect Cruz to stick to his guns is climate change. He denies the scientific consensus that human activity significantly contributes to climate change and faults "alarmists" for spurring hysteria on the issue, points that he emphasized in a June interview with Yahoo! Politics.

Cruz argues that scientific data disprove the theory behind climate change since there has been no recorded warming during the past 15 years. Climate researchers have said that assertion is wrong and much of the warming during the past decade has occurred in the oceans, an indication that the Earth has more thermal heat.

Environmental advocates say simply that Cruz can't secure the Republican nomination.

"I think that Ted Cruz is not seriously going to make it," Heather Taylor-Miesle, director of the NRDC Action Fund, told Bloomberg BNA.

#### MARCO RUBIO

## Rubio Quiet on Environment, Disputes Role of Human Activity in Climate Change

lorida Sen. Marco Rubio (R) has devoted little public comment to environmental issues as a senator, but he is remembered for roundly denying in 2014 the scientific consensus that human activity contributes to climate change.

The first-term Florida senator has staked out familiar Republican positions opposing numerous environmental regulations from President Barack Obama's administration, and he has co-sponsored legislation to roll many of them back. But Rubio himself has devoted just two of 226 bills he has introduced since January 2011 to environmental issues.

Rubio, whose campaign did not respond to request for comment, has rarely discussed energy and environmental issues since jumping into the Republican fray on April 13.

Industry observers expect Rubio rarely to veer from familiar Republican talking points opposing Environmental Protection Agency rules and other Obama environmental initiatives, while environmental advocates said they will raise the heat on Rubio for what they described as the "ultimate hypocrisy" for denying climate change in a state already feeling the brunt of the problem.

**'Significant Scientific Dispute' on Climate.** On multiple occasions, Rubio has called into question the scientific consensus that human activity significantly contributes to climate change.

"I don't agree with the notion that some are putting out there, including scientists, that somehow there are actions we can take today that would actually have an impact on what's happening in our climate," Rubio said in a 2014 interview with ABC's This Week. "I do not believe that human activity is causing these dramatic changes to our climate the way these scientists are portraying it."

In 2009, the Florida Republican said there is "significant scientific dispute" about the causes of climate change. During a 2013 interview, Rubio said, "I've actually seen reasonable debate" on whether there is a scientific consensus on the issue and, in his 2013 State of the Union Address response, Rubio slammed government regulations and said "our government can't control the weather."

It marked a departure for Rubio's time in the Florida Legislature, where in 2008 he argued that a federal capand-trade system was "inevitable" and said Florida should work to develop its own program. He maintains he always opposed the approach.

Earlier in 2015, Rubio voted against two Senate amendments to legislation to approve the Keystone XL pipeline that stated human activity significantly contributes to climate change and Congress should take action to address the problem. Environmental advocates find Rubio's position particularly troublesome given that he comes from the Miami area, which has been especially vulnerable to impacts of sea-level rise.

"[Rubio] is kind of the worst kind of climate denier in many respects because his state is under water," Heather Taylor-Miesle, director of the NRDC Action Fund, told Bloomberg BNA. "His is really the worst kind of hypocrisy because you can't honestly say that something is not going on there."

**Opposes Clean Power Plan.** Throughout his time in the Senate, Rubio has opposed several EPA regulations aimed at addressing climate change and air pollution. A PAC affiliated with Rubio announced it was gathering signatures to stop "Obama's job-killing EPA overreach" shortly after the agency announced its plans to address carbon dioxide pollution from existing power plants.

"The idea that we must destroy our economy by raising utility prices for Americans so the world will follow is naive," Rubio wrote in June 6, 2014. "Countries like China and India are going to continue to grow their economy and watch as we suffocate ours with regulations."

Rubio also has pushed legislation that would make permanent a moratorium for small vessels less than 79 feet long from having to obtain Clean Water Act National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System permits. The Florida Republican has vowed to advance legislation in 2015 and called it a top priority.

Florida's junior senator has devoted considerable time to water quality issues unique to his state. In 2012, Rubio introduced a bill to require the federal EPA to adopt state standards for several nutrients, including total nitrogen and total phosphorus, to improve water quality and to reduce algal blooms caused by pollution.

**Endorsement of Republican Energy Stances.** Rubio also has lent his support to legislation reflecting Republican priorities on a number of energy and environmental issues, although he has never introduced such legislation himself.

During his time in Congress, Rubio has backed bills to block the federal government from regulating hydraulic fracturing, approve the proposed Keystone XL pipeline, reform the management of offshore energy development, kill a proposed Clean Water Act jurisdictional rulemaking and modernize the nation's chemical safety law, among others.

Rubio also backed a sense of the Senate resolution stating the EPA rules for regulating carbon dioxide emissions for both new and existing power plants should be withdrawn, and a similar bill to require any regulation on power plant carbon emissions to obtain explicit congressional approval.

#### RAND PAUL

## Some Nuance Seen for Paul on Climate Change, Environmental Justice Issues

**S** en. Rand Paul (R-Ky.), a first-term senator known for being unafraid to buck his party on some issues, has rarely strayed from near-universal Republican stances opposing Environmental Protection Agency regulations.

Paul could set himself apart from some other Republican presidential contenders, however, through his views on issues such as the renewable fuel standard.

Some observers believe Paul has taken a more nuanced position on climate change by backing an amendment in January that said human activity contributes though not significantly—to the problem that could serve him well if he becomes the Republican candidate for president in 2016.

"It's something that could definitely help him in the general election, but in the primary they could tie him around the neck," Ford O'Connell, a Republican strategist who advised Sen. John McCain (R-Ariz.) on energy issues during his 2008 presidential run, told Bloomberg BNA.

Paul, who announced his candidacy for president April 7 in Louisville, Ky., has a 9 percent lifetime voting record from the League of Conservation Voters. His campaign didn't respond to requests for comment.

**Unlikely Focus for Primary.** Multiple observers told Bloomberg BNA that environmental issues are unlikely to be a major focus for the Paul campaign—or for Republicans overall—during the primary phase of the contest.

Chris Vieson, who served as director of floor operations for former House Majority Leader Eric Cantor (R-Va.), said across most environmental issues there would be a small degree of difference among Republican presidential candidates because "everyone's for less regulations, for fracking, coal, oil and gas use."

For Paul, taking stances aligned with his Republican colleagues on these issues complements his actions as a senator. Paul introduced legislation (S. 226) that would subject regulations with an annual impact of \$100 million or more on the national economy to an up-or-down vote in the House and Senate.

He also has opposed numerous EPA regulations, such as its ground-level ozone proposal and has said the agency has "done more harm than good" since its inception in 1970.

Paul has been critical of President Barack Obama's broader Climate Action Plan to address climate change and the Clean Power Plan, which aims to curb carbon dioxide emissions from the nation's fleet of existing power plants. In June, he called the power plan "an illegal use of executive power." He later co-sponsored legislation to block issuance of the EPA's power plant rules. **'Nuanced Differences.'** Vieson, now a partner at public relations firm Public Strategies Washington Inc., said a few "nuanced differences" would set Paul apart from his Republican primary counterparts in environmental policy, including his support for solar and biomass tax credits.

These differences would speak to a younger generation of Republicans, Vieson said.

Another issue where Paul has nuanced views is climate change. But the result is an unclear perception of where he stands.

In January, Paul joined with 14 other Senate Republicans in voting for an amendment to legislation to approve the Keystone XL pipeline stating that human activity contributes to climate change, although he later voted against another amendment to the same bill, which stated human activity "significantly" contributes to the problem. Both amendments were defeated.

Earlier, in April 2014, Paul said he was "not sure anybody exactly knows why" the climate is changing, while complaining of the "alarmist stuff" dominating the political debate on the issue. He has also said that he supports certain regulations, provided they wouldn't cripple the economy or cost thousands of jobs.

Paul's climate change stance appears to have become a contentious issue for him. A voter questioned Paul at a July 25 campaign event in New Hampshire on climate change. He told the voter to "sit down, I don't need to hear any more lectures," the Boston Globe reported.

Environmental advocates, lobbyists and other observers think there is little to suggest significant daylight between Paul and other Republican candidates who openly challenge the notion that human activity is playing a role in climate change. Heather Taylor-Miesle, director of the NRDC Action Fund, called Rand Paul "a caricature" on the issue.

Eli Lehrer, president of the R Street Institute, believes many of the perceived differences between Paul and other Republicans on climate policy are overstated.

**Renewable Fuel Standard.** Another area where Paul can set himself apart is the renewable fuel standard. An aide to Paul told the National Journal in April that the senator supports removing market barriers for biofuel products, but doesn't support "the government telling consumers or businesses what type of fuel they must use or sell."

Finally, Paul will distinguish himself from other contenders through his economic mobility focus, which he highlighted when announcing his presidential bid April 7. He may not gain support for the effort from some disadvantaged communities because he wants to allow polluting industries to relocate to those communities.

#### CHRIS CHRISTIE

## **Christie's Decision to Leave RGGI Said to Undermine Climate Change Stance**

w Jersey Gov. Chris Christie (R), who acknowledges climate change but favors less federal environmental regulation, calls his personality of "telling it like it is" one of his major strengths as a candidate.

Christie, who has served as the Garden State's governor since January 2010, has said climate change is real and that humans contribute to it, a position uncommon among Republican presidential candidates.

But there have been questions raised about his environmental record since he withdrew New Jersey from the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative. RGGI is a ninestate cap-and-trade program aimed at reducing carbon dioxide emissions from power plants.

Environmental entities and industry representatives alike are hopeful that Christie will align himself with their respective priorities as president. But a Republican strategist and an environmentalist separately told Bloomberg BNA that Christie's environmental views aren't as nuanced as some might expect.

"He can say what he wants, but when you look at the record, he is no different from Bobby Jindal, Ted Cruz or other folks regarding climate change," Jeff Tittel, director for the New Jersey chapter of the Sierra Club, told Bloomberg BNA.

In his speech announcing his presidential candidacy June 30 in Livingston, N.J., Christie barely mentioned the environment, noting only that New Jersey has recovered from a natural disaster. Christie also emphasized his desire to limit federal regulations and "get the government off the backs of our businesses."

His campaign did not respond to Bloomberg BNA's requests for comment.

**Climate Change Credibility.** Christie unequivocally stated in April that global warming is real and human activity is part of the problem after previously wavering on that question. "I believe climate change is real," he said at the time. "The question is how you address it."

Christie still hasn't said definitively how much human activity contributes to climate change.

The Sierra Club's Tittel said Christie's statements acknowledging climate science shouldn't spark hope of more of an environmental stance. He is far from the top environmental contenders for the Republican nomination, which for Tittel includes former New York Gov. George Pataki and former Florida Gov. Jeb Bush.

Christie also differs from his counterparts in his support for the renewable fuel standard, the requirement to blend ethanol and other biofuels into the fuel supply.

On energy issues, the Republican contender has expressed support for energy development, highlighting

pro-energy stances likely to become the status quo among the party's presidential hopefuls.

In a May Wall Street Journal op-ed, Christie called for the development of a national energy strategy, including the construction of the Keystone XL pipeline, lifting the crude oil export ban and promoting fair regulation of the energy industry.

**State Record.** Christie's actions in New Jersey, meanwhile, may offer examples of how the governor's broader policy stances play out in practice.

For example, Christie withdrew New Jersey in 2011 from RGGI, a step that NextGen Climate, an advocacy group, contends led the state to miss out on more than \$100 million in revenue, as well as public health and environment benefits. Christie said he left RGGI because it "does nothing more than tax electricity, tax our citizens, tax our businesses, with no discernible or measurable impact upon our environment."

Christie has highlighted his efforts to rebuild New Jersey in the aftermath of Hurricane Sandy. Those efforts, though, have come under fire from groups ranging from environmental advocates to media outlets. They say Christie's refusal to consider climate change impacts during rebuilding could leave the state more vulnerable to flooding or sea-level rise than neighboring states.

The New Jersey governor also has taken significant flak from legislators, academics and others over the state's recent \$225 million pollution settlement with Exxon Mobil Corp. Opponents say that settlement to resolve cleanups of oil refinery sites in Bayway and Bayonne is far too lenient and could have included up to \$9 billion in penalties, though Christie has defended the settlement as "fair and historic."

There also has been speculation about Christie's current stance on offshore wind energy. The governor signed a bill in 2010 that would boost offshore wind renewable energy development, but since then has created roadblocks for at least one company seeking to develop a wind farm, according to the Washington Post.

**'Nothing to Lose.'** Mike McKenna, a Republican lobbyist and strategist, told Bloomberg BNA that the New Jersey governor's environmental record as a candidate would likely be in line with Republicans such as Jeb Bush or his brother former President George W. Bush (R).

McKenna believes Christie could use the environment as an issue to distance himself from other Republican presidential contenders.

"The tricky thing about Christie is he's got nothing left to lose," McKenna said. "He's going to be a fairly dangerous candidate."

#### JOHN KASICH

## Kasich Acknowledges—But Unsure of Causes Behind—Climate Change

**O** hio Gov. John Kasich (R), who launched his campaign for the presidency July 21, recognizes possible environmental harm from climate change, but isn't sure what causes the problem.

Under the two-term governor, Ohio's state environmental agency has opposed the Environmental Protection Agency's Clean Power Plan by arguing that it is illegal and unworkable. In addition, Kasich's views on the renewable fuel standard remain unclear.

Overall, Kasich's state record—delaying renewable energy mandates and barring oil and gas drilling in certain areas—is mixed, resulting in the feeling that his policies "could have been worse," Julian Boggs, global warming program director for Environment America and former director of the group's Ohio state chapter, told Bloomberg BNA.

"He's defined compromise as, 'We didn't gut the existing bill as much as we could have' or 'We didn't cave to the most extreme parts of party,' "Boggs said of Kasich's actions as governor. "It's a really bizarre version of compromise."

Kasich received a League of Conservation Voters lifetime score of 27 percent for his environment and energy actions taken during nearly two decades in the House of Representatives from 1983 until 2001.

**Addressing Climate Change.** Kasich has said he believes that climate change is real and a problem. It is unclear, however, the extent to which he acknowledges that humans are part of the problem or how concerned he is about finding solutions.

In a July interview with the Financial Times, Kasich said humans should not "worship" nature in response to a question about Pope Francis's recently released encyclical on the environment and climate change.

"Of course we've got to be concerned about [climate change], but we shouldn't worship the environment," Kasich said. "And I wouldn't want to create any dramatic economic change of policy because I'm still not sure—I don't know that anybody is fully sure—of all the causes and all the science."

Boggs questioned whether Kasich's views on how to address climate change appropriately would evolve because of the value the governor places on his faith and morality.

**Room for Evolution.** "His faith seems to be a thing that really emboldens him to buck the party," Boggs said, citing divergences from party lines on issues such as Medicare.

Other environmentalists were less hopeful than Boggs, with Daniel J. Weiss, senior vice president for campaigns for the League of Conservation Voters, telling Bloomberg BNA that Kasich is still a "climate denier." "Questioning climate science is like questioning the link between smoking and lung disease," Weiss said.

In the meantime, under Kasich's watch, Ohio's state environmental agency opposed some federal efforts to address climate change. The state agency told the federal EPA that its proposed Clean Power Plan that would set limits for carbon dioxide emissions by state "is technically flawed, not legal and unworkable in its current form."

**Industry Concerns.** Chris Warren, a spokesman for the American Energy Alliance, told Bloomberg BNA that it is surprising that Kasich himself hasn't come out strongly against the Clean Power Plan, considering how reliant his state is on coal for electricity.

"Americans are increasingly concerned about EPA overreach and it's not clear whether Gov. Kasich is willing to rein in the agency and protect the public from higher electricity rates," Warren said.

Kasich's views on the renewable fuel standard remain unclear as well. On June 24, Kasich clearly stated that he supported phasing out the standard, according to the Des Moines Register.

One month later, though, Kasich didn't directly answer a question regarding the standard that requires mixing biofuels into the fuel supply. He said states should again receive authority to deal with "a bunch of things," a separate Des Moines Register story reported.

**Ohio Record.** Kasich's state record is mixed, said Boggs, who emphasized that when considering the Republican candidates he is "grading on a curve."

He signed legislation (Am. Sub. S.B. 310) in 2014 that delayed for two years renewable energy mandates, despite more than 50 companies such as Honda Motor Co. Ltd. saying there would be significant economic benefits by moving forward on the mandates.

The state also walked back its renewable energy standards. Weiss said this action "may be difficult to explain when he's campaigning in Iowa since Republican leaders there strongly support incentives for wind energy."

On the other hand, Kasich effectively blocked oil and gas drilling in state parks. A spokesman for Kasich told the Columbus Dispatch in February 2014 that the governor opposed this type of action, "because the governor doesn't think we have the policies in place yet to properly do it."

The governor also issued in July 2012 an executive order barring oil and gas drilling in Lake Erie. The order essentially duplicates law passed by Congress that already bars drilling in the lake but is a fail-safe if Congress changes its mind, Kasich then said.

#### **RICK SANTORUM**

## Santorum, Who Called Global Warming 'Junk Science,' Softens Climate Rhetoric

ormer Sen. Rick Santorum (R-Pa.), who has called global warming "junk science," may be beginning to soften his climate change rhetoric just slightly.

Santorum has doubted whether human activity contributes to climate change and whether it plays a role in issues such as international security—which are major priorities for President Barack Obama. However, in an e-mail to Bloomberg BNA his campaign didn't answer a question regarding how much human activity causes climate change.

"Senator Santorum believes that the climate has always been changing; however, the question is what do we do about it and whether the United States can impact climate change, given the lack of environmental regulations in nations like China," his campaign said, adding that the Obama administration's plan would only harm American manufacturing.

He supports the renewable fuel standard, the Keystone XL pipeline and an "all-of-the-above" energy strategy, his campaign said.

The two-term Pennsylvania senator, who announced his campaign on May 27, has consistently opposed fed-

eral attempts to regulate greenhouse gas emissions and congressional attempts to address climate change.

Santorum said in 2011 on Rush Limbaugh's radio show that it is "patently absurd" to link carbon dioxide to climate change, and said he had never "even accepted the junk science behind the whole narrative."

He told CNN in January there is "clearly" nothing the U.S. can do to address changes in the Earth's climate, because it wouldn't affect other countries' actions.

The former senator has sought to discredit Pope Francis and others in the climate debate.

The pope should leave science to scientists, Santorum said in June after the pope issued an encyclical framing climate change as a moral issue. On Bloomberg Politics July 22, Santorum said comments by former Maryland Gov. Martin O'Malley (D), also a presidential contender, that the rise of the Islamic State (ISIS) is connected to climate change shows "a disconnection from reality."

The League of Conservation Voters gave Santorum a lifetime environment rating of 10 percent.

#### **GEORGE PATAKI**

## **RGGI Founder Pataki Says Unclear How Much Humans Cause Climate Change**

ormer New York Gov. George Pataki (R), who highlighted climate change as an immediate problem as governor, questioned in an interview with Bloomberg BNA to what extent human activity causes global warming.

Despite this, Pataki said it would be prudent "to have intelligent policies, consistent with economic growth and not driving up the costs of energy, to reduce [carbon dioxide] emissions."

Pataki, who declared his candidacy May 28, said states should be the laboratories of democracy. That means actions he took as governor, such as initiating a regional cap-and-trade program for greenhouse gas emissions and implementing a renewable portfolio standard, are appropriate where similar federal actions have not been.

Now Pataki wants to phase out the federal renewable fuel standard and opposes the Environmental Protection Agency's Clean Power Plan, which aims to reduce carbon emissions from the power sector. He also supports use of renewable energy, the Keystone XL pipeline and preserving open spaces.

Pataki, who served as governor from 1995 through 2006, proposed the Northeast's regional cap-and-trade system. He initially proposed the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative in 2003 as a cap-and-trade approach that would be modeled after federal programs for nitrogen oxides and sulfur dioxide.

Now Pataki says he is "extremely disappointed" in the program, due to the following administration's changes to his approach that aimed to keep the program "revenue-neutral" for the state and "priceneutral" for the consumer.

After leaving the governor's mansion, Pataki agreed to co-chair a Council on Foreign Relations task force on climate and national security. The report from that project urged the U.S. to take the lead in cutting greenhouse gas emissions to spur other international efforts and encouraged Congress to pursue an emissions trading system.

#### **BOBBY JINDAL**

## Jindal Acknowledges Some Human Role in Climate Change, but Favors Fossil Fuels

ouisiana Gov. Bobby Jindal (R) has a more nuanced stance on climate change than many of his fellow Republicans. He acknowledges human activity makes some contribution to the problem, but Jindal nevertheless favors expanding fossil fuel development and has consistently opposed efforts from President Barack Obama to address the changing climate.

Unlike many of his fellow candidates, Jindal released a detailed plan outlining his energy and climate platform in September 2014. That document called for eliminating Environmental Protection Agency rules for addressing carbon pollution, expanding offshore oil and gas drilling operations, approving the Keystone XL pipeline and eliminating tax subsidies for wind and solar industries, among other provisions.

Jindal, who assumed office in 2008 and entered the presidential race June 24, said during a July interview with Fox News "I'm sure that human activity has some impact on the environment" but added "how much, I'll leave to scientists."

"We can have a strong economy, affordable energy and protect our environment," Jindal said. "This president doesn't believe you can do all of those things.... We shouldn't be doing anything that unilaterally hurts our economy vis-a-vis our competitors, countries we compete with and trade with like this president is doing with China."

In September 2014, Jindal described climate change as a "Trojan horse" for Democrats to mandate significant changes to the U.S. economy and questioned how much of a contribution human activity had on the climate.

"It's a way for them to come in and make changes to our economy that they would otherwise want to make," the governor said at the Heritage Foundation. "It's an excuse for the government to come in and try to tell us what kind of homes we live in, what kind of cars we drive, what kind of lifestyles we can enjoy."

**Criticism of EPA.** Even while taking a more nuanced approach on climate change than many Republican candidates, Jindal has consistently criticized EPA efforts to regulate carbon dioxide emissions and vowed to overturn the agency's rules if elected.

"These regulations—plus the mere threat of flawed proposals like cap and trade, which in 2008 the president said would 'bankrupt' anyone who wanted to open a coal plant—are sending a message that the United States is not a viable place for major, multiyear capital investments," Jindal wrote in a 2012 Wall Street Journal op-ed piece. Instead, Jindal argues, the U.S. should expand oil and gas drilling on federal lands, rapidly increase offshore drilling, avoid any federal regulation of hydraulic fracturing and lift decades-old restrictions on exporting crude oil.

To address climate change, Jindal said the U.S. shouldn't act without the cooperation of other major nations, should devote additional resources to technological development and should focus on "no regrets" policies like forest management, while also withdrawing from United Nations negotiations.

#### We can have a strong economy, affordable energy

#### and protect our environment.

GOV. BOBBY JINDAL (LA.)

"The fundamental and underlying problems with Kyoto-style solutions, run through a corrupt and unaccountable United Nations, have been pointed out again and again, not just by climate change skeptics, but by many who, though concerned about climate change, understand the UN's dismal record in international environmental treaties and the inherent structural flaws" in the international climate negotiation process, Jindal wrote in his energy platform.

**Sharp Words From Environmentalists.** Jindal's work on environmental and energy issues, especially on local matters during his time as governor, drew sharp criticism from environmental advocates.

"[A Jindal presidency] would be a complete and utter disaster," Mike Stagg, a civic activist in Louisiana, told Bloomberg BNA. "It would amount to the gutting of EPA and all environmental regulations."

Although Jindal earned some praise for his response to the 2010 BP oil spill, he signed legislation in June 2014 to protect the oil and gas industry from what he described as "frivolous lawsuits" and introduced a bill while a U.S. representative in 2006 to encourage construction of deep-sea drilling platforms around the country.

Stagg isn't the only one worried by Jindal's stances on the environment. Another environmentalist—Anne Rolfes, founding director for the Louisiana Bucket Brigade—referred to Jindal as a "train wreck" on a number of issues, including the environment, in an e-mail to Bloomberg BNA.

Jindal's campaign did not respond to requests for comment.

#### CARLY FIORINA

## Fiorina Acknowledges Human Role in Climate Change, Sees Innovation as Solution

arly Fiorina, who headed Hewlett-Packard Co. from 1999 through 2005, does not dispute the scientific consensus that human activity significantly contributes to climate change. But she has said federal and state regulations harm lives while not making "a bit of difference in" addressing the problem.

Fiorina, who made an unsuccessful run for the U.S. Senate in California in 2010, has said technological research and development should be the solution to climate change.

"I believe, as with many problems, the answer to this problem is not regulation, it is innovation," Fiorina said in February 2015. "And, frankly speaking, the [Environmental Protection Agency] is shutting down every ounce of innovation in this area and I don't think that we're paying attention to all the science. I think too many politicians are paying attention only to the part of the science that confirms their ideology."

Fiorina, who entered the presidential race May 4, said in June 2015 that she supports building the Keystone XL pipeline, phasing out the renewable fuel standard, lifting crude oil export restrictions and rolling back prohibitions on energy exploration on federal and state lands.

Federal and state regulatory efforts make little difference in the global problem of climate change but cost thousands of jobs, Fiorina has said repeatedly.

"I'm prepared to take the scientists at their word scientists say climate change is man-made," Fiorina said in May on the NBC program "Late Night with Seth Meyers."

"[But] why would we destroy all these jobs with regulations when the answer to climate change is innovation, not regulation? We're just kind of shooting ourselves in the head and in the foot right now."

Global efforts at reducing greenhouse gas emissions would be ineffective because many nations will simply refuse to follow the U.S. lead, Fiorina said at an April Christian Science Monitor event.

Fiorina, the lone woman in the Republican presidential field, also called California's devastating multi-year drought a "man-made disaster" fueled by the burdensome regulatory requirements pushed by "liberal environmentalists."

Her campaign did not respond to requests for comment.

#### **BEN CARSON**

## **Carson Says Little on Environment, Disputes Human Role in Climate Change**

**R** etired John Hopkins neurosurgeon Ben Carson has spoken of the need to protect the environment but disputes the scientific consensus that human activity significantly contributes to climate change.

Carson, who has never held elected office, has not made the environment a centerpiece of his political platform but did author an op-ed piece in 2014 expressing support for conservation while casting skepticism at the causes of climate change.

"Whether we are experiencing global warming or a coming ice age, which was predicted [in] the 1970s, we as responsible human beings must be concerned about our surroundings and what we will pass on to future generations," Carson wrote in the March 2014 op-ed. "However, to use climate change as an excuse not to develop our God-given resources makes little sense."

Rather than "stifle" energy production and development through regulations, the EPA should work "in conjunction with business, industry and universities to find the most eco-friendly ways of developing our energy resources," Carson told Bloomberg News in November 2014.

Carson, who rose to prominence in 2013 after criticizing President Barack Obama during the National Prayer Breakfast, frequently cites his medical background and support for science in his speeches but nevertheless rejects the overwhelming consensus among climate scientists.

"We may be warming," Carson, who entered the race in early May, told Bloomberg News. "We may be cooling."

The retired neurosurgeon also has voiced support for building the proposed Keystone XL oil pipeline, calling the infrastructure project "perfectly safe." His campaign didn't respond to requests for comment.

#### LINDSEY GRAHAM

## Graham Rare Republican Urging Action on 'Moral' Issue of Climate Change

**S** en. Lindsey Graham (R-S.C.) believes human activity significantly contributes to climate change and has faulted his party for not adopting a clearer position on the issue.

Graham, whose stance puts him at odds with most of the other Republicans seeking their party's nomination, nevertheless has objected to efforts from President Barack Obama's administration to address the problem through Environmental Protection Agency regulations.

"The EPA has repeatedly overstepped its bounds and needs to be reined in," Graham said in a statement to Bloomberg BNA. " I believe President Obama's command-and-control approach to the environment and climate change is a disaster. His policies are wrecking our economy. As president, I would take a completely different approach."

That approach would be working with private sector companies to build on their ongoing efforts to address climate change, but doing so in a "responsible, costeffective, market-friendly way," according to Graham, who joined the race June 1.

#### 'This is an issue of national and economic security,

#### as well as a moral issue.'

SEN. LINDSEY GRAHAM (S.C.)

Other keys to addressing the problem would be an "all-of-the-above" approach that includes renewable energy sources such as solar and wind energy.

"With an all-of-the-above approach, we can end our dependence on oil from hostile regimes, create thousands of new jobs and ensure we have the energy that a growing economy needs," Graham said. "At the same time, we have to do this in a way that preserves the water we drink and the air we breathe. This is an issue of national and economic security, as well as a moral issue."

Graham said he supports building the proposed Keystone XL pipeline. "We should be doing everything we can to bring about energy independence and invest in new infrastructure," he said.

In addition, Graham continues to support the renewable fuel standard.

"I believe the use of renewable fuels like ethanol has an important role to play in our efforts to expand energy production in an environmentally friendly way," Graham said. **Believes Scientists.** The South Carolina Republican is one of the few from his party to back the scientific community's assessment that human activity significantly contributes to climate change. Graham says he does so in spite of the uncertainty about the impacts of climate change.

"The scientific evidence strongly shows that climate change is occurring, and that human activity is a significant factor," he told Bloomberg BNA in a statement. "What's not well understood is exactly what the impact will be. Our military leadership is concerned that the effects on our security could be substantial, as dwindling resources, food shortages, and natural disasters fuel greater conflict and instability around the world. I take their concerns seriously."

South Carolina's senior senator has criticized both parties for how they've debated climate issues. He recently slammed his fellow Republicans for lacking ideas to address the problem.

"What is the environmental platform of the Republican party?" Graham asked at a March 2015 event at the Council on Foreign Relations. "I'd like to have a debate within the party. Can you say that climate change is a scientifically sound phenomenon? But can you reject the idea you have to destroy the economy to solve the problem, is sort of where I'll be taking this debate."

**Faults Debate Tone.** The South Carolina Republican, the fifth sitting senator running for president, stands in sharp contrast to his fellow Republican candidates in calling climate change "an urgent crisis facing the world," but he also has faulted Democrats for making sincere debate on the topic difficult.

"You made climate change a religion rather than a problem," Graham said to Democrats during Senate floor debate on the Keystone pipeline in January. "I wish you would change your mind about the pipeline and work with Republicans who are willing to work with you to deal with emissions in a realistic way and stop selling what I think is a fraud when it comes to this debate."

Despite those comments, Graham was one of just five Republicans senators to ultimately back a "sense of the Senate" amendment that human activity significantly contributes to climate change.

Graham also joined then-Sens. John Kerry (D-Mass.) and Joseph Lieberman (I-Conn.) in pursuing comprehensive climate change legislation in 2009 and 2010 before ultimately abandoning those efforts.

#### JIM GILMORE

## **Gilmore Says Little on Environment but Acknowledges Climate Change**

ormer Virginia Gov. Jim Gilmore, who faces an uphill climb in the crowded Republican presidential field, has said very little publicly on environmental issues during the past decade-and-a-half.

Gilmore, who last held public office as Virginia governor from 1998 through 2002, acknowledged climate change was occurring during his unsuccessful 2008 run for Virginia's Senate seat, but said he was unsure of man's contribution to the problem.

"We know the climate is changing, but we do not know for sure how much is caused by man and how much is part of a natural cycle change," Gilmore said, according to the Virginian-Pilot. "I do believe we must work toward reducing emissions without damaging our fragile economy."

On energy, Gilmore told the newspaper he favored expanded domestic drilling, including offshore in the Outer Continental Shelf and in the Arctic National Wildlife Refuge in Alaska.

"We also need to encourage private industry to continue its development of alternative fuels, alternative energy sources and clean coal technology, which is of particular importance to Virginia," he said in 2008. "We need to streamline the burdensome regulatory process so we can build more oil refineries, more nuclear power plants and clean coal facilities."

Gilmore briefly sought the presidency in 2008 before dropping out due to fund-raising difficulties. During a presidential debate, Gilmore said "we have to have energy independence" but he did not outline specific steps to achieve that goal.

Gilmore formally filed his paperwork to enter the 2016 race on July 29.

Efforts to contact Gilmore's campaign were unsuccessful.