## RM Power Sector Implementation of a Country Coal-to-Clean Tansition

**BRIEF FOR IMPLEMENTERS** 

Charting a path to a clean, prosperous, and reliable power system in Southeast Asia



## Authors, Contributors and Acknowledgements

#### **Authors**

**Koben Calhoun Rachit Kansal** Dhroovaa Khannan Udetanshu

#### **RMI Contributors**

- Benjamin Bartle
- Esra Bozkir Broekman
- **Rizky Fauzianto**
- Thanh Ha
- Diego Angel Hakim
- Juan Luis Vial Lavin
- Tyeler Matsuo

#### **Contributors from Other Organizations**

- Fakhrul Aufa, PT SMI
- Abhishek Bhaskar, Climate **Investment Funds**
- Puti Faraniza, PT SMI

Thank you to Edo Mahendra, from KEMENKO-MARVES, for his inputs. RMI would like to thank Bloomberg Philanthropies for their support of this work.



**Chiagozie Obuekwe** 

 Sam Mardell • Brian O'Hanlon • Jeremy Richardson Aaron Schwartz • Lauren Shwisberg • Matt Sugihara • Uday Varadarajan

• Elrika Hamdi, IEEFA Mark Meldrum, SystemIQ Katherine Stodulka, SystemIQ • Agra Suryadwipa, SystemIQ



#### **About RMI**

RMI is an independent nonprofit founded in 1982 that transforms global energy systems through market-driven solutions to align with a 1.5°C future and secure a clean, prosperous, zero-carbon future for all. We work in the world's most critical geographies and engage businesses, policymakers, communities, and NGOs to identify and scale energy system interventions that will cut greenhouse gas emissions at least 50 percent by 2030. RMI has offices in Basalt and Boulder, Colorado; New York City; Oakland, California; Washington, D.C.; and Beijing.







## **Objectives and Key Audiences**

This brief highlights key questions relevant to implementing the coal-to-clean transition in the power sector.

By indicating which questions are wellunderstood and which are less understood, it identifies where knowledge sharing will help drive the transition and where further exploration and new insights are needed.

Finally, the brief lays out how these various questions interconnect and shares an integrated roadmap to address them collectively.



#### **AUDIENCES**

- **Implementation-focused and regulatory bodies** identify how levers (e.g., policy, financing, community input), additional resources (e.g., analysis, research), and stakeholder engagement can ensure answers to identified questions are developed, adapted, and implemented at scale to advance the transition.
- **Utilities** identify areas for sharing best practices with other utilities and regulators, and areas for further resourcing to best position the utility to engage on the transition.
- Local CSOs (technical and non-technical) share existing tools and solutions relevant to the identified solutions, develop new areas of work for questions that need answering, and advocate for better, more comprehensive, and inclusive processes.









## **Table of Contents**

Executive Summary	•
ntroduction	•
Context and Guide on Using this Brief	• •
Power Sector Implementation Framework	•••
Stage 1: Define Scope of Transition	
Early Win" Coal Transition Pilot	•
stage 2: Define Technically Feasible Pathways	
stage 3: Develop Transition Plan	
stage 4: Secure Financing for Transition Plan	
tage 5: Prepare for Implementation	٠
itage 6: Implement and Scale	٠

#### Appendices

Appendix B: Indonesian Context.













**POWER SECTOR IMPLEMENTATION OF A COUNTRY COAL-TO-CLEAN TRANSITION:** BRIEF FOR IMPLEMENTERS

# **Executive Summary**





Building off momentum for a coal-to-clean transition, countries are now pivoting to designing and implementing it. A multi-faceted approach is needed - one that integrates grid operations, alignment with economic opportunity, enabling policies, transition financing, and strong execution.

#### **IF TRANSITION DOES NOT ...**





i Strong execution includes sufficient institutional capacity and know-how, and clear governance structures. ii Support for people affected by the transition, and economic growth opportunities. iii Costs for customers and taxpayers stay low. iv Key companies and sovereigns are financially stable.





### Such an approach raises a set of key questions that need to be answered along the road to implementation, some that are better understood than others.









## For questions that have been relatively well-answered, proactive sharing and scaling of existing insights and best practices is needed. This includes discussing how such solutions could be adapted to various local contexts.

Example Question	Applicable Le
Lenses for Transition	Plan
Grid operations	
Alignment with economic opportunity	
<b>Enabling policies</b>	
Transition financing	
Strong execution	









## The answers to other questions are somewhat understood, with insights that are beginning to emerge. These areas need further testing, research, and analysis.

Example Question	Applicable Lens	
Lenses for Transition	Plant-	
<b>Grid operations</b>		
Alignment with economic opportunity		
<b>Enabling policies</b>	What can support for workers an communitie look like at plant level?	
<b>Transition financing</b>		
Strong execution		



Somewhat Understood









## The answers to other questions are somewhat understood, with insights that are beginning to emerge. These areas need further testing, research, and analysis.

<b>Example Question</b>	Applicable Len
Lenses for Transition	Plant
<b>Grid operations</b>	
Alignment with economic opportunity	
<b>Enabling policies</b>	Wha of fir repla
<b>Transition financing</b>	
Strong execution	



ns

Somewhat Understood









## Finally, the answers to a subset of questions are not well understood at all. Significant attention, planning, and resourcing is needed here.

Example Question	Applicable Lens	Nc
Lenses for Transition	Piloting and Plant-Level Engagement	Planning and System-Level Engageme
Grid operations		How can policymaking, raising transition capital, and maintaining grid operations interplay? How
Alignment with economic opportunity		can they be sequenced to support economic opportunity and climate ambition?
Enabling policies		How can the transition support the financial stability of key
Transition financing		companies and sovereigns?
Strong execution		









## As an example, RMI shares a high-level process for how pilots can interact with and inform the investment planning process ...





answering unanswered questions.





## ... and how policymaking, raising transition capital, and maintaining grid operations can be co-considered and sequenced to develop an effective transition and investment plan.

Leverage capacity expansion and production cost modeling to identify subset of technically feasible scenarios that are low cost and have reasonable financing needs.

Solicit input from relevant stakeholders and communities to eliminate any scenarios that are unrealistic or burdensome to disadvantaged people.

Identify policies (including regulations) to be introduced, modified, or removed. Layer policy options onto scenarios to further narrow down technically feasible options.

Legend



Grid operations



**Policies** 

Financing **Needs and** Mechanisms

Community

and Worker

Support

\$





(\$)

Leverage portfolio financial modeling to identify financial mechanisms for coal and clean generation that support capital mobilization and low costs and impacts.

Leverage outputs from techno-economic modeling to estimate financing needs for clean infrastructure.

For narrowed subset of scenarios, define activities

**Consult affected** workers and communities, as well as experts, to define financing needs for support, remediation, and pre-closure planning.

INITIAL TRANSITION PLAN Develop









































**POWER SECTOR IMPLEMENTATION OF A COUNTRY COAL-TO-CLEAN TRANSITION:** BRIEF FOR IMPLEMENTERS

## Introduction





The past few years have seen significant momentum for the global coal-toclean transition with several emissions, coal phaseout, and financing commitments. However, there are structural barriers to implementing the transition, and it needs careful planning and consideration.

Many utilities and regulators face the challenge of ensuring sufficient power supply for rapidly growing economies as they manage heavy indebtedness, wavering grid reliability, and insufficient capacity for implementation.





NOTE: According to the IEA's Net Zero Emissions by 2050 Scenario, advanced economies would need to phase out unabated coal by 2030 and the rest of the world by 2040 to limit average global temperature rise to 1.5°C compared to pre-industrial levels.

#### Relationship Between Coal Transition Programs in South Africa and Indonesia





/ 16

A successful coal-to-clean transition must not only facilitate rapid emissions cuts and keep the lights on, but it also must support economic opportunity, ensure affordability, and support the financial stability of key institutions.



#### Lights stay on

Ensures short- and longterm grid reliability and resource adequacy for all customers.



#### **Growth and** opportunity

Includes support for people affected by the transition (e.g., workers, communities, local governments) in the short and long run, as well as broader economic growth and diversification.





#### **Costs stay low**

Costs for electricity (and associated services) are low for customers and taxpayers.



#### **Rapid cuts** in emissions

**Carbon dioxide emissions** decline rapidly as the economy grows and electrifies.



#### **Stable institutions**

Key companies (e.g., utilities) and sovereigns are financially stable through and at the end of the transition.







Successful implementation of the transition requires an integrated approach that considers grid operations, aligns with economic opportunity, and includes enabling policies, transition financing, and strong execution. While all are valued, ensuring the lights stay on and the transition is politically viable are crucial.

#### **IF TRANSITION DOES NOT ...**





v Strong execution includes sufficient institutional capacity and know-how, and clear governance structures. vi Support for people affected by the transition, and economic growth opportunities. vii Costs for customers and taxpayers stay low. viii Key companies and sovereigns are financially stable.



WHERE WE NEED TO BE



### Such an approach raises a set of key questions that need to be answered along the road to implementation, some that are better understood than others.





**ix** Understood collectively by the global community acting on coal-to-clean transitions.





## For questions that have been relatively well-answered, proactive sharing and scaling of existing insights and best practices is needed. This includes discussing how such solutions could be adapted to various local contexts.

Example Question	Applicable Le
Lenses for Transition	Plant
Grid operations	
Alignment with economic opportunity	
<b>Enabling policies</b>	
Transition financing	
Strong execution	









## The answers to other questions are somewhat understood, with insights that are beginning to emerge. These areas need further testing, research, and analysis.

Example Question	Applicable Lens	
Lenses for Transition	Plant-	
Grid operations		
Alignment with economic opportunity		
<b>Enabling policies</b>	What can support for workers ar communiti look like at plant level	
Transition financing		
Strong execution		



Somewhat Understood









## The answers to other questions are somewhat understood, with insights that are beginning to emerge. These areas need further testing, research, and analysis.

Example Question	Applicable Ler
Lenses for Transition	Plant
<b>Grid operations</b>	
Alignment with economic opportunity	
<b>Enabling policies</b>	Wha of fil repla
<b>Transition financing</b>	
Strong execution	



ns

Somewhat Understood









## Finally, the answers to a subset of questions are not well understood at all. Significant attention, planning, and resourcing is needed here.

Example Question Applicable Lens		Not U
Lenses for Transition	Piloting and Plant-Level Engagement	Planning and System-Level Engagement
Grid operations		How can policymaking, raising transition capital, and maintaining grid operations interplay? How
Alignment with economic opportunity		can they be sequenced to support economic opportunity and climate ambition?
Enabling policies		How can the transition support the financial stability of key
Transition financing		companies and sovereigns?
Strong execution		









**POWER SECTOR IMPLEMENTATION OF A COUNTRY COAL-TO-CLEAN TRANSITION:** BRIEF FOR IMPLEMENTERS

## Context and Guide on Using This Brief





**CONTEXT AND GUIDE ON USING THIS BRIEF** 

The framework and solutions offered in this brief build off the work of others, broadening and distilling insights from the investment plans developed through the Climate Investment Funds Accelerating Coal Transition (CIF ACT) and Just Energy Transition Partnership (JETP) processes.

Additionally, RMI's framework complements other existing frameworks, by highlighting questions relevant to the power sector implementation of a country's coal-to-clean transition.

The framework also shares established, emerging, and new insights that address those questions and demonstrates how those insights interconnect.



#### **COMPLEMENTARY FRAMEWORKS ON COAL-TO-CLEAN TRANSITION**

#### **World Economic** Forum's (WEF's) System Value **Framework**

Defines "system value" as a holistic framework that evaluates economic, environmental, social, and technical outcomes of potential energy solutions.

**Evaluates** list of Indonesian decarbonization solutions against framework, in terms of feasibility and impact.

#### **British International Investment's (BII's) Transition Finance for** Africa 🗹

Shares guidance on how to strategically and credibly deploy (blended)

capital across sectors, to mitigate emissions and support economic development.



governance systems.

Heavy focus on coal mining, less on power sector.





#### **CONTEXT AND GUIDE ON USING THIS BRIEF**

#### Breakdown of Indonesia's Energy Supply, by Source<sup>1</sup>



#### **Breakdown of Indonesia's Electricity Generation, by Source<sup>2</sup>**





## This brief uses Indonesia as an example. It is particularly apt for this as a major economy in Southeast Asia that has increasingly relied on coal to power its economy and its electricity (40 GW of current coal capacity and <u>13 GW in</u> the pipeline *z*) but also has gathered substantial momentum to phase it out.

Various Financing Commitments Made to **Support Indonesia's Coal-to-Clean Transition** 







#### **CONTEXT AND GUIDE ON USING** THIS BRIEF

## How should readers use this brief?

This brief uses the Indonesian example to ground abstract concepts into reality, and highlight where progress has been made in the coal-to-clean transition and where work remains to be done – both within and outside of Indonesia.



References stage of planning or piloting process, for users to track as they review the brief

Indicates whether the current page is laying out a **conceptual** process, or sharing real-world use cases, examples, and case studies



**References the specific questions** (questions key to implementation of the transition) being answered in the current page





#### **Questions Being Addressed**

What are the financial pathways to transition a single plant?

How can a coal plant be transitioned to ensure financial feasibility and resource adequacy?

#### WHAT WHAT HAS BEEN COULD BE DONE? **DONE?** For pages that walk through

real-world examples, breaks out where there has been progress in Indonesia (and other geographies), and where more work remains to be done

#### CONTEXT

- The brief highlights questions relevant to the **power sector implementation** of a country's coal-to-clean transition and shares existing and new insights to address those questions. Thus, by design, it will not share (detailed) insights for all issues but aims to point the reader in helpful directions.
- The brief is grounded in Indonesia as an example, but is applicable to other geographies.

- Local stakeholders could consider this brief as a starting point and adapt it as they see fit for their context. They may "pick and choose" parts of this brief as is relevant for their contexts.
- The brief reflects RMI's understanding of the current state of the transition — it should be **updated as answers** emerge and collective experience accumulates.









**POWER SECTOR IMPLEMENTATION OF A COUNTRY COAL-TO-CLEAN TRANSITION:** BRIEF FOR IMPLEMENTERS

## Power Sector Implementation Framework





informing the development of the other.





## The roadmap for a country's coal-to-clean transition involves planning and implementation at the system and plant level, with learnings from each process

answering unanswered questions.





## System Planning Process – Stage 1

#### SYSTEM PLANNING





transition effort.

PROJECT

pathways to repurposing coal plants) and begin answering unanswered questions.





## System Planning Process – Stage 1 Overview



for its power sector and its coal fleet?



remediating their surroundings?

**STAGE 1** 

#### **DEFINE SCOPE OF TRANSITION**

**CONCEPTUAL** 



development objectives?



coal-to-clean transition?



energy sector?



- What is the scope of the country's climate ambitions
- What is the scope for the country's support for supporting impacted people (e.g., workers and communities), providing them opportunities, and
- How does the country define its economic and human
- What are the roles of different stakeholders in the
- What other domestic or geopolitical objectives does the country have, that overlap with the electricity and



- **Emissions**, power system capacity, plant phaseout and **buildout** targets
- Scope of activities for supporting affected people, related economic development, and environmental remediation
- Which stakeholders will be playing what roles



## System Planning Process – Stage 1 Steps



What is the scope of the country's climate ambitions for its power sector and its coal fleet?



What is the scope for the country's support for supporting impacted people (e.g., workers and communities), providing them opportunities, and remediating their surroundings?



How does the country define its economic and human development objectives?



What are the roles of different stakeholders in the coal-toclean transition?



What other domestic or geopolitical objectives does the country have, that overlap with the electricity and energy sector?

#### WHAT COULD BE DONE?



#### **DEFINE SCOPE OF TRANSITION**

APPLIED

(IN INDONESIA)

#### **Questions Being Addressed**

How does the country want to support affected people and the broader economic opportunity at the system level?



Initiate stakeholder consultation process with civil society, local governments, labor, local communities, and others (South Africa's JET IP consultations IP consul

#### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

- Updated NDC 🗹 with net zero by 2060; 32% emissions reduction (unconditional) vs. 2010 levels by 2030
- Partially signing **C** onto Global Coal to **Clean Power Transition Statement at COP26**

#### WHAT COULD BE DONE?

- Explicit coal phaseout and power sector decarbonization targets in closer alignment with a 1.5°C trajectory – conditional on significant financial support.
- Providing concrete plans (e.g., integrated resource plans, schedule of plant tenders, commitments in legislation) to demonstrate commitment and provide certainty to financiers on the intention and ambition to transition.





## System Planning Process – Stage 1 Steps



What is the scope of the country's climate ambitions for its power sector and its coal fleet?



What is the scope for the country's support for supporting impacted people (e.g., workers and communities), providing them opportunities, and remediating their surroundings?



How does the country define its economic and human development objectives?

## 

What are the roles of different stakeholders in the coal-toclean transition?



What other domestic or geopolitical objectives does the country have, that overlap with the electricity and energy sector?

#### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

• Structure of the Indonesian ETM Country Platform I that includes stakeholders involved in financing, advising, steering, running, and implementing projects.



**STAGE 1** 

**DEFINE SCOPE** 

What is the role of different stakeholders *in the system planning process?* 

What institutional capacities are needed to execute on the system transition?



#### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

- National Medium Term Development Plan 2020-24, 🗹 which specifies that the green economy is to be the foundation for Indonesia's development. Promotes community resilience, reduced emissions, rural economic development, and more.
- **Annual National Development Targets** that explicitly tie emissions and development. <u>The 2021 version</u> **C** targeted a 5% growth rate, 7%–9% unemployment rate, emissions reductions ~30% by 2030, and more.

#### WHAT COULD BE DONE?

Beyond the government and financiers, which other stakeholders must be involved and in what capacities?







## Summary – Stage 1

#### **Output includes:**

- Emissions, power system capacity, plant phaseout and buildout targets
- Scope of activities for supporting affected people, related economic development, and environmental remediation
- Which stakeholders will be playing what roles

Example Question



S	TAGE	1

#### DEFINE SCOPE OF TRANSITION

<b>Lenses for Transition</b>	Plant
<b>Grid operations</b>	
Alignment with economic opportunity	
<b>Enabling policies</b>	
<b>Transition financing</b>	
Strong execution	









## "Early Win" Coal Transition Pilot



RMI

transition effort.

PROJECT

answering unanswered questions.



## "Early Win" Coal Transition Pilot Overview

**PLANT LEVEL** 

"Early win" coal transition project selected

"EARLY WIN" COAL TRANSITION PILOT

CONCEPTUAL

#### **Questions Being Addressed**

What are the financial pathways to transition a single plant?

How can a coal plant be transitioned to ensure financial feasibility and resource adequacy?

How do pilots interact with and inform the system planning process?

Using current and projected technoeconomic data about the coal plant and surrounding resources, conduct simplified techno-economic modeling to determine feasible technical pathways to reduce plant emissions



Narrow down on technical pathways based on credible emissions reductions



Identify any legal constraints around financing mechanisms and plant phaseout





Identify any financial constraints for plant owners (e.g., being heavily indebted) and stakeholder priorities (managing cost burden, maximizing emissions reductions, minimizing plant owner impacts)

Using identified legal and financial constraints, as well as stakeholder priorities, identify Coal Transition Mechanisms (CTMs) to facilitate early transition of coal plant

Using pathways identified from technoeconomic model as inputs, run plantlevel financial model to evaluate impact of using CTMs (vs. business-as-usual) on all relevant stakeholders and emissions

Select viable integrated financial and techno-economic option for decarbonizing coal plant




# "Early Win" Coal Transition Pilot Steps



### "Early win" coal transition project selected

Using current and projected techno-economic data about the coal plant and surrounding resources, conduct simplified techno-economic modeling to determine feasible technical pathways to reduce plant emissions



Narrow down on technical pathways based on credible emissions reductions



Identify any legal constraints around financing mechanisms and plant phaseout



Identify any financial constraints for plant owners (e.g., being heavily indebted) and stakeholder priorities (managing cost burden, maximizing emissions reductions, minimizing plant owner impacts)



Using identified legal and financial constraints, as well as stakeholder priorities, identify Coal Transition Mechanisms (CTMs) to facilitate early transition of coal plant



Using pathways identified from techno-economic model as inputs, run plant-level financial model to evaluate impact of using CTMs (vs. business-as-usual) on all relevant stakeholders and emissions



Select viable integrated financial and techno-economic option for decarbonizing coal plant

#### **"EARLY WIN" COAL TRANSITION** PILOT

APPLIED

### **Questions Being Addressed**

What are the financial pathways to transition a single plant?

How can a coal plant be transitioned to ensure financial feasibility and resource adequacy?

How do pilots interact with and inform the system planning process?



### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

### **Cirebon Power Plant, C** owned by an Independent Power Producer (IPP)

- Asian Development Bank (ADB) signs MoU with Cirebon **Electric Power (CEP) and PLN to discuss early retirement of** Cirebon-1 in West Java.
- It is anticipated that ADB would provide an early retirement facility in the form of concessional senior debt, on the condition the PPA between CEP and PLN is shortened.

### Pelabuhan Ratu Power Plant, 🗹 owned by Indonesian Utility PLN

- Indonesian state-owned coal mining company PT Bukit Asam Tbk (PTBA) to take over ownership of the plant and shorten its operation from 24 to 15 years.
- The takeover will use low-cost funding under Indonesia's **Energy Transition Mechanism (ETM) country platform.**





# "Early Win" Coal Transition Pilot Steps



"Early win" coal transition project selected

Using current and projected techno-economic data about the coal plant and surrounding resources, conduct simplified techno-economic modeling to determine feasible technical pathways to reduce plant emissions



### Narrow down on technical pathways based on credible emissions reductions

Identify any legal constraints around financing mechanisms and plant phaseout



Identify any financial constraints for plant owners (e.g., being heavily indebted) and stakeholder priorities (managing cost burden, maximizing emissions reductions, minimizing plant owner impacts)



Using identified legal and financial constraints, as well as stakeholder priorities, identify Coal Transition Mechanisms (CTMs) to facilitate early transition of coal plant



Using pathways identified from techno-economic model as inputs, run plant-level financial model to evaluate impact of using CTMs (vs. business-as-usual) on all relevant stakeholders and emissions



Select viable integrated financial and techno-economic option for decarbonizing coal plant

#### **"EARLY WIN"** COAL TRANSITION PILOT

APPLIED

### **Questions Being Addressed**

What are the financial pathways to transition a single plant?

How can a coal plant be transitioned to ensure financial feasibility and resource adequacy?

How do pilots interact with and inform the system planning process?



### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

Guidelines for Financing a Credible Transition, C developed by RMI, Climate Policy Initiative (CPI), and Climate Bonds Initiative (CBI), introduces a framework to assess coal plant eligibility, coal transition pathways, social protection, and accountability associated with a CTM.

- The CTM results in emissions savings compared with a case without the use of the CTM and has a backstopping commitment to phase out unabated coal combustion at the coal plant by country-specific, 1.5°C-aligned coal phaseout deadlines.
- The coal plant owner has an entity-level commitment to no new coal power plant development or procurement.







# "Early Win" Coal Transition Pilot Steps



"Early win" coal transition project selected

Using current and projected techno-economic data about the coal plant and surrounding resources, conduct simplified techno-economic modeling to determine feasible technical pathways to reduce plant emissions



Narrow down on technical pathways based on credible emissions reductions



Identify any legal constraints around financing mechanisms and plant phaseout



Identify any financial constraints for plant owners (e.g., being heavily indebted) and stakeholder priorities (managing cost burden, maximizing emissions reductions, minimizing plant owner impacts)



Using identified legal and financial constraints, as well as stakeholder priorities, identify Coal Transition Mechanisms (CTMs) to facilitate early transition of coal plant



Using pathways identified from techno-economic model as inputs, run plant-level financial model to evaluate impact of using CTMs (vs. business-as-usual) on all relevant stakeholders and emissions



Select viable integrated financial and techno-economic option for decarbonizing coal plant

#### "EARLY WIN" COAL TRANSITION PILOT

APPLIED

### **Questions Being Addressed**

What are the financial pathways to transition a single plant?

How can a coal plant be transitioned to ensure financial feasibility and resource adequacy?

How do pilots interact with and inform the system planning process?



### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

RMI developed a model that **pairs** detailed asset and corporatelevel **financial analysis** with a **simple economic dispatch model**, to understand the transition of a coal plant owned by Indonesian utility PLN.

Power plant **capacity projections** and **marginal costs** by resource, and current relative merit order position of pilot plant **Techno-economic data** about pilot plant and replacement resources

**Simple dispatch model** that balances projections of hourly demand with hourly dispatch, tracks curtailment and must-run resources

Utility and plant **financials** and costs of capital

**Plant-level financial model** that examines impacts of transition with and without CTMs, and compares with business as usual

**Impacts on:** i) Utility financials (earnings, cash flow); ii) System costs (including broader grid costs); iii) Implicit cost of carbon for concessional funds; iv) Lifetime CO2 emissions savings



/ 39

# System Planning Process – Stage 2

### **SYSTEM PLANNING**



**COAL TRANSITION** PILOT

build trust and momentum in the broader transition effort.



**COAL TRANSITION** PROJECT

pathways to repurposing coal plants) and begin answering unanswered questions.



## System Planning Process – Stage 2 Overview

×%\*

Given plan developed in Stage 1, governmental and regulatory bodies leverage capacity expansion and production cost modeling to develop a set of technically feasible scenarios that meet country climate goals<sup>x</sup>

**STAGE 2** 

DEFINE **TECHNICALLY** FEASIBLE **PATHWAYS** 



For each scenario, estimate: a) aggregate financing needs<sup>xi</sup> b) costs to customers and taxpayers

**CONCEPTUAL** 

### **Questions Being Addressed**

*How can policymaking, raising transition* capital, and maintaining grid operations interplay? How can they *be sequenced to support economic* opportunity and climate ambition?



Input from community and workforce representatives, and from assessments that estimate impacts of transition on workers and communities



Input from other stakeholders (e.g., industries, project financiers)



x Currently excluding captive power plants. xi Financing needs for generation pathways identified from techno-economic modeling. xii Consider eliminating scenarios that do not support the bankability of the broader project pipeline.









## System Planning Process – Stage 2 Steps



Given plan developed in Stage 1, governmental and regulatory bodies leverage capacity expansion and production cost modeling to develop a set of technically feasible scenarios that meet country climate goals.

For each scenario, estimate:

- a) aggregate financing needs
- b) costs to customers and taxpayers



Input from other stakeholders (e.g., industries, project financiers)



Input from community and workforce representatives, and from assessments that estimate impacts of transition on workers and communities



Leverage modeling results

#### **Questions Being Addressed**

**STAGE 2** 

DEFINE

**TECHNICALLY** 

FEASIBLE

**PATHWAYS** 

APPLIED

How can policymaking, raising transition capital, and maintaining grid operations interplay? How can they be sequenced to support economic opportunity and climate ambition?



Governmental and regulatory bodies eliminate any scenarios that are:

- Unrealistic or politically infeasible
- Asking disadvantaged people to bear risks best borne by others



### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

**Institute of Energy Services Reform's (IESR's)** Deep Decarbonization of Indonesia's Energy System 🗹 used the LUT Energy Transition Model — an economy-wide energy-sector deep decarbonization model. It was used to develop various decarbonization scenarios for the electric and electrifying sectors.

The model considered **policy sensitivities** and **optimized for** system cost while ensuring resource adequacy and grid integrity.

### WHAT COULD BE DONE?

Instead of using capacity expansion and production cost modeling to identify a single final scenario on a least-cost basis, it could instead be leveraged to develop a selection of technically feasible scenarios based on different assumptions and constraints that are **down-selected on criteria beyond just** system cost.





# System Planning Process – Stage 2 Steps



Given plan developed in Stage 1, governmental and regulatory bodies leverage capacity expansion and production cost modeling to develop a set of technically feasible scenarios that meet country climate goals.

- For each scenario, estimate:
- a) aggregate financing needs
- b) costs to customers and taxpayers



Input from other stakeholders (e.g., industries, project financiers)



Input from community and workforce representatives, and from assessments that estimate impacts of transition on workers and communities

### 0

### Leverage modeling results

### **Questions Being Addressed**

**STAGE 2** 

DEFINE

**TECHNICALLY** 

FEASIBLE

**PATHWAYS** 

APPLIED

*How can stakeholder consultations* be integrated w/analytical system planning processes?



Governmental and regulatory bodies eliminate any scenarios that are:

- Unrealistic or politically infeasible
- Asking disadvantaged people to bear risks best borne by others



### WHAT COULD BE DONE?

**Stakeholder-driven modeling C** and robust input into the resource planning process. This includes:

- Open access on as much nonconfidential data used in utility modeling as possible
- Ensuring stakeholder input into modeling assumptions early in the planning process (e.g., The regulators of the US state of Hawaii require use of public data **C** for resource and fuel costs)
- If there is capacity, encourage alternative stakeholder-driven modeling portfolios





### Summary – Stage 2

### **Output includes subset of technically feasible scenarios that:**

- Incorporate worker and community support and compensation
- Minimize customer/taxpayer costs
- Have realistic aggregate financing needs

Example Question



**STAGE 2** 

DEFINE TECHNICALLY FEASIBLE **PATHWAYS** 





**Sufficiently Understood** 

Somewhat Understood

Not Understood



# System Planning Process – Stage 3





transition effort.

answering unanswered questions.



## System Planning Process – Stage 3 Overview



Given subset of technically feasible scenarios, define role of policy<sup>xiii</sup>



What inhibiting policies or regulations are being modified or removed?



What supporting policies or regulations are being added or modified?

**STAGE 3** 

DEVELOP TRANSITION PLAN

**CONCEPTUAL** 

### **Questions Being Addressed**

How can policymaking, raising transition capital, and maintaining grid operations interplay? How can they *be sequenced to support economic* opportunity and climate ambition?





Layer techno-economic modeling with various policy options and down-select scenarios according to:

- Aggregate financing needs
- Costs to customers and taxpayers

Define the role of finance

Develop set of activities that need support. Activity buckets include:

- Coal emissions reductions
- Clean infrastructure
- Support and remediation
- Planning and implementation

**Continued on next page** 

xiii Policies here can refer to national or local legislation, utility regulation, proclamations that carry the force of law, or current paradigms on market and contractual structures. / 46







## System Planning Process – Stage 3

**Continued from previous page** 



### Define amount of support needed for other clean infrastructure

Use net present value (NPV) of costs for new transmission additions from capacity expansion modeling to quantify financing needed for clean infrastructure bucket



### Define amount of support needed for coal and clean generation

Which subset of financial mechanisms are a good fit given local context and priorities?



### Define amount of support needed for all other activities

Consult stakeholders (especially workers and communities) and experts extensively to define

**STAGE 3** 

DEVELOP TRANSITION PLAN

**CONCEPTUAL** 

### **Questions Being Addressed**

How can policymaking, raising transition capital, and maintaining grid operations interplay? How can they be sequenced to support economic opportunity and climate ambition?



Identify combination of mechanisms that:

- Ensure mobilization of capital
- Minimize costs
- Minimize impacts on workers and communities



Identify characteristics of financing (debt, equity, blended, costs, term length) needed, as well as any applicable financing mechanisms



Transition and investment plan that includes details on financing needs for each activity bucket, the generation and transmission transition plan, and relevant timelines









# System Planning Process – Stage 3 Steps

Given subset of technically feasible scenarios, define role of policy What inhibiting policies or regulations are being modified or removed? What supportive policies or regulations are being added or modified? Layer techno-economic modeling with various policy options and down-select scenarios according to: **STAGE 3** • Aggregate financing needs • Costs to customers and taxpayers DEVELOP TRANSITION PLAN Define the role of finance APPLIED Define set of activities that need support. Activity buckets **Questions Being Addressed** Which policies would best support a coal-to-clean transition?

### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

Clean energy PPA prices were **capped at an index C** that was heavily weighted by subsidized coal-based production prices, making it challenging for clean projects to recover their costs. Regulation 112 <sup>C</sup> altered this to **cap prices** close to the levelized cost of renewable energy (LCOE) — providing more room for projects to grow. Further modification may be needed.



### WHAT COULD BE DONE?

Articles 2 and 3 of Act No. 31/1999 🗹 ("Eradication of the **Criminal Act of Corruption**") — which recommends imprisonment for anyone that "...may cause loss to the state finance or state economy..." — may need to reconsidered or modified to ensure sufficient safeguards against corruption while not disincentivizing innovation and risk-taking by PLN.

Indonesia's Local Content Requirement (LCR) C stipulates that ~40% of clean energy project materials and 100% of project services must be **procured in-country**.<sup>xiv</sup>

The current version of LCR, while designed to protect and grow domestic industry, has made it **difficult to source cheaper materials and services** internationally — thus, challenging the profitability of clean energy projects. Modification may be needed.





## System Planning Process – Stage 3 Steps



Given subset of technically feasible scenarios, define role of policy

What inhibiting policies or regulations are being modified or removed?

### What supportive policies or regulations are being added or modified?

**STAGE 3** 

DEVELOP

TRANSITION

PLAN

APPLIED

**Questions Being Addressed** 

a coal-to-clean transition?

Which policies would best support

Layer techno-economic modeling with various policy options and down-select scenarios according to:

- Aggregate financing needs
- Costs to customers and taxpayers



Define the role of finance



Define set of activities that need support. Activity buckets include:

- Coal emissions reductions
- Clean infrastructure
- Support and remediation

**Continued on page 53** 



• Planning and implementation

### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

### **Presidential Regulation 112,** <sup>[]</sup> which:

- Bans the development of new coal power, unless already in the pipeline
- Provides a pathway (and state support) to terminate coal **PPAs early**
- Raises the ceiling tariff for new renewable energy, improving chances at profitability
- **Provides incentives and support for geothermal energy**

### WHAT COULD BE DONE?

Reforming utility procurement of power to be **all-source**, inclusive of utility and distributed-scale, transparent, <sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub> and aligned to the objectives laid out by regulators and policymakers.





# System Planning Process – Stage 3 Steps

What inhibiting policies or regulations are being modified or removed? What supportive policies or regulations are being added or +modified? Layer techno-economic modeling with various policy options and down-select scenarios according to: **STAGE 3** • Aggregate financing needs • Costs to customers and taxpayers DEVELOP TRANSITION PLAN Define the role of finance APPLIED Define set of activities that need support. Activity buckets **Questions Being Addressed CASE STUDY – UNITED STATES** *How can utility resource* planning practices support ambitious climate goals?

more.

Which policies would best support

a coal-to-clean transition?

Given subset of technically feasible scenarios, define role of policy

The US state of Hawaii comprehensively reformed 🗹 its utility's business model so that its **earnings were directly linked to performance** across a wide variety of outcomes, including i) affordability, ii) decarbonization, iii) grid modernization, iv) customer engagement, v) distributed energy development, and

### **CASE STUDY - INDIA**

Considering <u>short-term markets</u> **C** that move away from bilateral procurement of power purchase agreements (PPAs) and include:

- **Real-time and ancillary markets** that allow for low-cost and rapid procurement of flexible resources
- **Demand and supply-side resource participation** that allows for optimization of demand and supply-side dispatch of wide range of available and new resources (e.g., storage, electric vehicles, behind-the-meter solar)

### **CASE STUDY – KENYA**

Kenya implemented its <u>Renewable Energy Auction Policy</u> <sup>I</sup> in 2021, which seeks to ensure **renewable power** projects are **competitively procured** through rounds of transparent auctions, all in line with utility and national energy plans. Furthermore, its accompanying 2021 Feed-In Tariff (FiT) Policy aims to **standardize PPA terms** and provide renewables incentives, building on previous, successful FiT programs.





## System Planning Process – Stage 3 Steps



Given subset of technically feasible scenarios, define role of policy



What inhibiting policies or regulations are being modified or removed?

What supportive policies or regulations are being added or modified?



+

Layer techno-economic modeling with various policy options and down-select scenarios according to:

- Aggregate financing needs
- Costs to customers and taxpayers



Define the role of finance

APPLIED

**STAGE 3** 

DEVELOP

TRANSITION

PLAN

#### **Questions Being Addressed**

What is the role of different types of financing in transitioning and replacing a fleet of coal plants?

### **Define set of activities that need support. Activity buckets** include:

- Coal emissions reductions
- Clean infrastructure
- Support and remediation

**Continued on page 53** 



• Planning and implementation

### WHAT HAS BEEN DONE?

**Climate Investment Funds (CIF)** established the multi-lateral **Accelerating Coal Transition (ACT) C** program to support country coal-to-clean transitions in a holistic, integrated, socially inclusive and gender-equal manner. Indonesia was selected in October 2021. CIF ACT aims to mobilize \$2B in MDB co-financing and over \$1B in commercial co-financing.

Activity Bucket	Indicative Financing (US\$ MM)	Type of Financing
Coal emissions reductions	2,801	Concessional and commercial debt, g
Clean infrastructure	1,060	Concessional and commercial debt
Support, remediation, planning, and implementation	1,364	Concessional and commercial debt, grants
TOTAL	5,225	



## System Planning Process – Stage 3 Steps



Given subset of technically feasible scenarios, define role of policy



-

What inhibiting policies or regulations are being modified or removed?



- Layer techno-economic modeling with various policy options and down-select scenarios according to:
- Aggregate financing needs
- Costs to customers and taxpayers



Define the role of finance

APPLIED

**STAGE 3** 

DEVELOP

TRANSITION

PLAN

#### **Questions Being Addressed**

What is the role of different types of financing in transitioning and replacing a fleet of coal plants?

### Define set of activities that need support. Activity buckets include:

- Coal emissions reductions
- Clean infrastructure
- Support and remediation

**Continued on page 53** 



• Planning and implementation

### **CASE STUDY - SOUTH AFRICA**

A group of developed countries have agreed to mobilize an initial amount of **US\$8.5 billion** over the next 3 to 5 years to advance a long-term Just Energy Transition Partnership (JETP) C that will support South Africa's decarbonization journey.

Activity Bucket	Indicative Financing (US\$ MM)	Type of Financing	Offer f Countr (US\$ MM)
Coal emissions reductions	150	Guarantees	1,300
Clean infrastructure	7,450	Concessional debt	5,325
Support and development	50	Grants	330
Planning and implementation	900	Commercial debt	1,500
TOTAL	8,550	TOTAL	8,455







# System Planning Process – Stage 3 Steps



Define amount of support needed for coal and clean generation

Which subset of financial mechanisms are a good fit given local context and priorities?

Identify combination of mechanisms that:

- Ensure mobilization of capital
- **Minimize costs**
- Minimize impacts on workers and communities



Define amount of support needed for other clean infrastructure

Use net present value (NPV) of costs for new transmission additions from capacity expansion modeling to quantify financing needed for clean infrastructure bucket



Identify characteristics of financing (debt, equity, blended, costs, term length) needed for each bucket, as well as any applicable financing mechanisms



Define amount of support needed for all other activities

Consult stakeholders (especially workers and communities) and experts extensively to define.



Transition and investment plan that includes details on financing needs for each activity bucket, the generation and transmission transition plan, and relevant timelines.



DEVELOP TRANSITION PLAN

APPLIED

### **Questions Being Addressed**

How can policymaking, raising transition capital, and maintaining grid operations interplay? How can they *be sequenced to support economic* opportunity and climate ambition?



### **CASE STUDY – UNITED STATES**

RMI has developed Optimus — a comprehensive utility model - that quantifies the impacts of financing mechanisms and policy scenarios on customers, shareholders, and other stakeholders.

It quantifies the impacts of local and national policies, CTMs, different utility business models, and more. Optimus is a complementary analytical tool to capacity expansion modeling - it uses the results from that modeling and applies a variety of policy and financial levers to calculate stakeholder impacts.

RMI has used Optimus (in collaboration with partners) for the **North Carolina carbon plan, C** and the model demonstrated that an alternative scenario with more clean power was cheaper, less exposed to fuel price hikes, and lower emitting.





# System Planning Process – Stage 3 Steps



Define amount of support needed for coal and clean generation

Which subset of financial mechanisms are a good fit given local context and priorities?

Identify combination of mechanisms that:

- Ensure mobilization of capital
- Minimize costs
- Minimize impacts on workers and communities



Define amount of support needed for other clean infrastructure

Use net present value (NPV) of costs for new transmission additions from capacity expansion modeling to quantify financing needed for clean infrastructure bucket



Identify characteristics of financing (debt, equity, blended, costs, term length) needed for each bucket, as well as any applicable financing mechanisms



Define amount of support needed for all other activities

### **Consult stakeholders (especially workers and communities)** and experts extensively to define.



Transition and investment plan that includes details on financing needs for each activity bucket, the generation and transmission transition plan, and relevant timelines.



**STAGE 3** 

DEVELOP TRANSITION PLAN

APPLIED

### **Questions Being Addressed**

What is the role of different stakeholders in the system planning process?

### **CASE STUDY - SOUTH AFRICA**

South Africa's Just Transition Framework **C** – released by the Presidential Climate Commission (PCC) — puts people at the center of decision-making, especially those most impacted, the poor, women, people with disabilities, and youth. The policy areas that constitute the framework include skills development, economic diversification and innovation, and social protection.

South Africa launched its Just Energy Transition Investment Plan 🗹 (JET IP) at COP 27 in November 2022, setting out the scale of need and the investments required at US\$98.7 billion for the five-year period, 2023–2027, to support its decarbonization commitments.





# System Planning Process – Stage 3 Steps



Define amount of support needed for coal and clean generation

Which subset of financial mechanisms are a good fit given local context and priorities?

Identify combination of mechanisms that:

- Ensure mobilization of capital
- Minimize costs
- Minimize impacts on workers and communities



Define amount of support needed for other clean infrastructure

Use net present value (NPV) of costs for new transmission additions from capacity expansion modeling to quantify financing needed for clean infrastructure bucket



Identify characteristics of financing (debt, equity, blended, costs, term length) needed for each bucket, as well as any applicable financing mechanisms



Define amount of support needed for all other activities

### **Consult stakeholders (especially workers and communities)** and experts extensively to define.



Transition and investment plan that includes details on financing needs for each activity bucket, the generation and transmission transition plan, and relevant timelines.



**STAGE 3** 

DEVELOP TRANSITION PLAN

APPLIED

### **Questions Being Addressed**

What is the role of different stakeholders in the system planning process?

### **CASE STUDY – UNITED STATES**

After an extensive consultation process with a wide array of stakeholders (including worker and community representatives), the state of Colorado passed legislation 🗹 to support coal transition in the state.

In addition to having strong customer protections, the law enables use of CTM proceeds to mitigate worker and community impacts **C** and requires utilities to fund already approved local government or school district projects.

The law also supports the financing of a newly established <u>Just</u> Transition Office **C** tasked with ensuring coal transition in the state supports affected people.





### Summary – Stage 3

### **Output includes transition and investment plan that contains:**

- Set of policies and regulations to be modified, stopped, or introduced
   Decourse plan with plant additions, rativements, and energy tions
- Resource plan with plant additions, retirements, and operations
- Financing needs, allocated by each "activity bucket

Example Question



ST	'AC	jΕ	3
		_	-

DEVELOP TRANSITION PLAN

<b>Lenses for Transition</b>	Plant
Grid operations	
Alignment with economic opportunity	
<b>Enabling policies</b>	
<b>Transition financing</b>	
Strong execution	



ements, and op

Sufficiently Understood

Somewhat Understood

Not Understood





# System Planning Process – Stage 4





answering unanswered questions.



# System Planning Process – Stage 4 Overview

Based on first draft of transition & investment plan, governmental implementation bodies develop:

timelines<sup>xiv</sup>

**STAGE 4** 

SECURE **FINANCING FOR** TRANSITION PLAN

**CONCEPTUAL** 



High-level, long-term financing plan with aggregate financing needs and



Detailed, near-term financing plan with breakdown by financing type and financial institution,<sup>xv</sup> and allocations for specific activities<sup>xvi</sup>

Do a roadshow with financiers to test appetite for financing plan

Refine and even revisit transition plan based on input from financiers and country priorities

Sign term sheets and secure financing for transition plan

xiv Should be publicly available. xv May not be publicly shared. RMI is assuming required due diligence and project preparation is completed before the detailed plant is developed. xvi This likely includes at least identifying (and potentially implementing) governance structures for measurement and verification.



# System Planning Process – Stage 4 Steps



High-level, long-term financing plan with aggregate financing needs and timelines



**STAGE 4** 

SECURE

**FINANCING FOR** 

TRANSITION

PLAN

APPLIED

Detailed, nearterm financing plan with breakdown by financing type and financial institution, and allocations for specific activities



Do a roadshow with financiers to test appetite for financing plan.



Refine and even revisit transition plan based on input from financiers and country priorities.



Sign term sheets and secure financing for transition plan.









Po



### **CASE STUDY – SOUTH AFRICA**

Details on financing by need, type of financing in <u>JET IP</u>

nvestment Area	<b>Financing</b> (ZAR billions)	Concessional	Commercial	Venture Capital	Grant	Buc
Electricity						
Decommission coal plants	4	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			1
Solar & Wind	498		$\checkmark$			
Batteries	23	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			1
<b>Fransmission &amp; Distribution</b>	465	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			١
Just Energy Transition (Mpumalanga Region)						
Repurposing of coal plants + mines	16.4	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	١
mprovement of infrastructure or development	12		$\checkmark$			1
Relief for coal workers - economic diversification	30	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	1
nvestment in youth	0.7				$\checkmark$	١
Policies for post-mining redevelopment	0.05				$\checkmark$	
Plan and capacity for success	1.3				$\checkmark$	1



### Summary – Stage 4

### **Output includes:**



**STAGE 4** 

SECURE **FINANCING FOR** TRANSITION PLAN







• High-level, long-term financing plan with aggregate financing needs and timelines; likely to be publicly available Detailed, near-term financing plan with specific financiers, allocations for financing of specific activities. Financial structuring (financing amounts,



# System Planning Process – Stage 5





answering unanswered questions.



## System Planning Process – Stage 5 Overview

**STAGE 5** 

#### PREPARE FOR IMPLEMENTATION

CONCEPTUAL

#### **Questions Being Addressed**

What institutional capacities are needed to execute on the system transition?

Scale appropriate governance structures identified in earlier stages and prepare them for wide-scale measurement, verification, and evaluation needs. Do this at all appropriate levels (national, provincial, local)

Strengthen capacity in key institutions at all appropriate levels (national, provincial, local)

Complete pre-closure planning through various lenses:

- Technical and grid reliability
- Worker and community support
- Policies and regulations



ability y support ns



## System Planning Process – Stage 5 Steps

Scale appropriate governance structures identified in earlier stages and prepare them for wide-scale measurement, verification, and evaluation needs. Do this at all appropriate levels (national, provincial, local)



Strengthen capacity in key institutions at all appropriate levels (national, provincial, local).



Complete pre-closure planning through various lenses:

- Technical and grid reliability
- Worker and community support
- Policies and regulations

#### STAGE 5

#### PREPARE FOR IMPLEMENTATION

APPLIED

### **Questions Being Addressed**

What institutional capacities are needed to execute on the system transition?



### **CASE STUDY – GERMANY**

Germany, as part of its <u>Act to Reduce and End Coal-Powered Power Generation</u>, is running a series of reverse coal auctions to identify, compensate, and retire its coal-fired power. To ensure scarce public funds are used effectively and to monitor progress, the country has a detailed monitoring, reporting, and verification (MRV) system.

#### **Monitoring and Reporting**

This includes <u>annual emissions self-reporting</u>  $\[Mathbb{C}]$  based on standardized, electronic templates. These monitoring reports will be released every three years, and the accompanying emissions data will be recorded in a national registry and be publicly available.

### **Verification**

Verification of the annual emissions data will be done by **accredited independent third-party** verifiers.

### Enforcement

Under the National Emissions Trading System (which incorporates coal phaseout), before 2025, entities must pay an **excess emissions penalty** for each tCO2 emitted, set at two times the fixed price.

After 2025, entities must pay EUR 100/tCO2 for each excess tCO2 emitted. Entities have one calendar year for compliance, and **can be fined**, if deemed appropriate.



# System Planning Process – Stage 5 Steps



Scale appropriate governance structures identified in earlier stages and prepare them for wide-scale measurement, verification, and evaluation needs. Do this at all appropriate levels (national, provincial, local)



Strengthen capacity in key institutions at all appropriate levels (national, provincial, local).

### $\bigotimes$

**Complete pre-closure planning thr** various lenses:

- Technical and grid reliability
- Worker and community support
- Policies and regulations

**STAGE 5** 

#### **PREPARE FOR IMPLEMENTATION**

**APPLIED** 

### **Questions Being Addressed**

What institutional capacities are needed to execute on the system transition?

> How does the country want to support affected people and broader economic opportunity at the system level?



rou	ıgh

### **CASE STUDY - SA JET-P PROCESS**

To ensure a just transition, 🗹 South Africa will conduct **pre-closure planning** across four interdependent priority areas:

- Repurposing coal power plants and coal mining lands
- **Economic diversification**
- Transition of workers and communities
- Enabling conditions for the transition (policies, regulations, and more)

### Key components include:

- Holding community consultations on future uses of affected land and developing repurposing strategies.
- Sharing timeline and soliciting feedback on **plant closure schedules**
- Developing **pre-layoff plan** income support, active labor market policies
- Performing interviews/focus groups with coal communities on "future without coal" vision, identifying pipeline of pilot projects in alternative promising sectors, and sharing call-for-proposals to implement pipeline
- Designing education, placement, and (public) **employment programs and** schemes

These specific community consultations build on consultations conducted through the process.





### Summary – Stage 5

### **Output includes:**

Example Question

Addressed

PREPARE FOR **IMPLEMENTATION** 

Lenses for Transition	Plan
Grid operations	
Alignment with economic opportunity	
<b>Enabling policies</b>	
Transition financing	
Strong execution	





• Appropriate governance structures in place, pre-closure planning complete, institutional capacities built up







## Stage 6: Implement and Scale







## Stage 6: Implement and Scale Overview

Plant Level

System Planning

### "EARLY WIN" COAL PILOTING

Share learnings and inform system planning

> SYSTEM PLANNING FOR FIRST DETAILED FINANCIAL PLAN

Tracking performance through input from financiers, communities, and utility, as well as measurement, reporting, and verification (MRV) systems

Time

**STAGE 6** 

**IMPLEMENT** 

"NEW FRONTIER" COAL TRANSITION PROJECT

CONCEPTUAL

### **Questions Being Addressed**

What institutional capacities are needed to execute on the system transition?

How can policymaking, raising transition capital, and maintaining grid operations interplay? How can they be sequenced to support economic opportunity and climate ambition?



**"NEW FRONTIER" COAL PROJECTS (ONGOING BASIS)** Informing design of multiple transition and financial plans





Through this brief, RMI has highlighted questions key to the power sector implementation of a country coal-to-clean transition, pointed to insights that address those questions, and demonstrated how those questions interconnect. Further work is needed – more knowledge sharing, scaling of solutions, and original research – to deepen and accelerate implementation.

**Example Question** 

Addressed

Lenses for Transition	Plant
Grid operations	
Alignment with economic opportunity	
<b>Enabling policies</b>	
Transition financing	
Strong execution	









**POWER SECTOR IMPLEMENTATION OF A COUNTRY COAL-TO-CLEAN TRANSITION:** BRIEF FOR IMPLEMENTERS

# Appendix A: Indonesian Stakeholder Landscape





### Stakeholder Landscape for Indonesia's Coal-to-Clean Transition<sup>xvii</sup>

			5				
	Government	Regulator	Financier	Workforce Rep.	Community Rep.	Civil Society	Utiliti IPP
Local	<ul> <li>MARVES</li> <li>MoF</li> <li>MEMR</li> <li>MSOE</li> <li>MOM</li> </ul>	• MOF • MEMR	<ul> <li>PT SMI</li> <li>INA</li> <li>Local Banks</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>APBI-ICMA</li> <li>KSBSI</li> </ul>	<ul><li>WALHI</li><li>IRES</li></ul>	<ul> <li>IESR</li> <li>Cerah</li> <li>TrendAsia</li> </ul>	<ul><li>PLN</li><li>APLSI</li></ul>
International	<ul> <li>US Gov't</li> <li>Japanese Gov't</li> <li>IPG</li> </ul>		<ul> <li>GFANZ</li> <li>ADB</li> <li>World Bank</li> </ul>	• ILO		<ul> <li>CPI</li> <li>E3G</li> <li>NRDC</li> <li>IEEFA</li> <li>CWC</li> </ul>	









### Glossary of Stakeholders: Government Ministries, Organizations, and Agencies

### Stakeholder Geographic Scope (Local/International)

Ministry of Energy and Mineral Resources ( — <u>esdm.go.id/en</u> ☑

Ministry of Finance (MOF) kemenkeu.go.id/home ☑

Coordinating Ministry for Maritime and Inves Affairs (MARVES) — <u>maritim.go.id</u>

Ministry of State-Owned Enterprises (MSO bumn.go.id

Ministry of Manpower (MOM) – kemnaker.

PT Sarana Multi Infrastruktur (Persero) (P<sup>-</sup> − <u>ptsmi.co.id</u> <sup>∠</sup>

PT Perusahaan Listrik Negara (Persero) (Pl portal.pln.co.id

Indonesian Private Electricity Manufacture Association (APLSI) — <u>aplsi.id</u>



	Туре	Short description
(MEMR)	Government	MEMR is responsible for providing assistance to the president and president in performing government's affairs in the field of energy mineral resources.
	Government	MOF is responsible for the nation's finance and state assets.
estment	Government	MARVES is in charge of planning, coordinating, and synchronizing policies in maritime affairs.
<b>DE)</b> —	Government	MSOE oversees the development of state-owned enterprises in Indonesia.
r.go.id 🗹	Government	MOM is responsible for the workers and labor laws of Indonesia.
PT SMI)	Government	PT SMI is the Special Mission Vehicle (SMV) under the Ministry of Fi that is engaged in financing and preparing infrastructure projects.
PLN) —	Utility	PLN is an Indonesian government-owned corporation that has a monopoly on electric power distribution in Indonesia and generate majority of the country's electrical power.
rers	IPP	APLSI is an association comprising Indonesian private electricity pro- with PT.PLN (Persero), the government, and entrepreneurs regarding matters related to the activities of Indonesian private power produce



### **Glossary of Stakeholders: Foreign Governments and International Organizations**

### Stakeholder Geographic Scope (Local/International)

United States — <u>whitehouse.gov</u>

Japan — japan.kantei.go.jp 🗹

**International Partners Group (IPG)** 

**Glasgow Financial Alliance for Net Zero (GF** − gfanzero.com

World Bank — worldbank.org

Asian Development Bank (ADB) – adb.org

International Labour Organization (ILO) — ilc



	Туре	Short description
	Government	The United States is working with Indonesia and International Part Group countries to support the goal of a swift and just energy tran
	Government	Japan and the United States are co-leading the International Partne Group (IPG) in the Just Energy Transition Partnership (JETP) for Indo
	Group of countries	IPG is a group of countries working together to support Indonesia's energy transition. They include the Governments of Japan, the Uni States, Canada, Denmark, the European Union, the Federal Repub Germany, the French Republic, Norway, the Republic of Italy, and t United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland.
FANZ)	Group of financial orgs.	GFANZ is a coalition of financial institutions committed to accelerating decarbonization of the economy. For Indonesia, they include Bank of A Citi, Deutsche Bank, HSBC, Macquarie, MUFG, and Standard Charterec
	International financial org.	The World Bank is an international financial institution that provid loans and grants to the governments of low- and middle-income countries for the purpose of pursuing capital projects.
	International financial org.	ADB is a regional development bank committed to promoting social economic development in Asia.
lo.org	International organization	The ILO is a United Nations agency with the mandate to advance so and economic justice by setting international labour standards.





/ 72

### **Glossary of Stakeholders: Local and International NGOs**

### Stakeholder Geographic Scope (Local/International)

**Institute for Essential Services Reform (IES** iesr.or.id/en

Yayasan Indonesia Cerah (CERAH) cerah.or.id/en 🗹

Climate Policy Initiative (CPI) climatepolicyinitiative.org

E3G — <u>e3g.org</u>

Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC) nrdc.org

**Institute for Energy Economics and Financi** Analysis (IEEFA) — <u>ieefa.org</u>

Climateworks Centre (CWC) climateworkscentre.org



	Туре	Short description
SR) —	NGO	IESR is a think-tank in the field of energy and environment that encourages transformation into a low-carbon energy system.
	NGO	CERAH is an Indonesian nonprofit organization working to advance tenergy transition policy agenda in Indonesia.
	NGO	CPI is an analysis and advisory organization with deep expertise in finance and policy helping governments, businesses, and financial institutions drive economic growth while addressing climate chang
	NGO	E3G is an independent climate change think tank with a global outlo tackling the barriers and advancing the solutions to a safe climate.
) —	NGO	NRDC is a global advocacy organization focused on protecting nate systems and the people that live within them. It works on climate change, food and water, health, and more.
cial	NGO	IEEFA examines issues related to energy markets, trends, and polic The Institute's mission is to accelerate the transition to a diverse, sustainable, and profitable energy economy.
	NGO	CWC bridges research and action, to achieve the system-level transitions required to reach net-zero emissions across Australia, Southeast Asia, and the Pacific.







### Glossary of Stakeholders: Workforce and Community Organizations

### Stakeholder Geographic Scope (Local/International)

Indonesian Forum for Living Environment (Wahana Lingkungan Hidup Indonesia, WAI walhi.or.id

Masyarakat Energi Terbarukan Indonesia (Indonesia Renewable Energy Society) (ME<sup>-</sup> — <u>meti.or.id</u>

Indonesian Coal Mining Association (APBI-I apbi-icma.org

Confederation of All Indonesian Trade Union (KSBSI) — <u>ksbsi.org</u>



	Туре	Short description
ALHI) —	NGO	WALHI is the largest and oldest environmental advocacy NGO in Indonesia. WALHI is part of the Friends of the Earth International (FoEI) network.
ETI-IRES)	NGO	METI is a forum to discuss and exchange views on strategic and pragmatic issues of using renewable energy to serve the nation's interest and objectives to be less dependent on fossil energy.
-ICMA) —	NGO	APBI-ICMA is an organization that embraces both upstream and downstream aspects of the coal industry in Indonesia, creating an environment for its members to discuss the common concern, exchang ideas, and works toward a common goal for the coal mining industry.
ns	Trade union	KSBSI is a national trade union center in Indonesia. It was founded in 1992 and claims a membership of 2.1 million.





**POWER SECTOR IMPLEMENTATION OF A COUNTRY COAL-TO-CLEAN TRANSITION:** BRIEF FOR IMPLEMENTERS

# Appendix B: Indonesian Context





### Indonesia's economy has grown rapidly in the past few decades, and its energy needs and coal consumption have quickly grown in parallel.

**Indonesia's GDP and GDP per Capita Grew by ~160%** and ~100% from 2000 to 2020<sup>3</sup>





Indonesia Consumed ~60% More Energy in 2020 than in 2000, and Coal Now Supplies ~30% of That Energy<sup>4</sup>





commitments to bolster those ambitions.





# On the other hand, over the past year, Indonesia has been steadily raising its climate and coal transition ambitions – and has secured international

### **October 2021**

PLN's 2021–2030 Electricity **Supply Business Plan** (RUPTL) 🛃 is released, with renewable energy projects being the majority of new generation capacity additions for the first time

### **March 2022**

**Country releases nationally** determined contribution (NDC) **Z** aiming for 29% unconditional emissions reduction (from BAU by 2030) and 41% reduction conditional on support

### November 2022

Asian Development Bank (ADB) and Indonesia partners sign MOU 🔀 for the early retirement of the 660 MW Cirebon 1 coal plant

#### 2021

#### 2022

### November 2021

Indonesia partially signs onto PPCA statement 🔀 saying it will "consider accelerating coal phaseout into the 2040s, conditional on agreeing additional international financial and technical assistance"

### **September 2022**

Indonesia submits enhanced NDC, 🔀 increasing its unconditional and conditional emissions targets from 29% to 32%, and from 41% to 43% respectively

### **November 2022**

Indonesia and **International Partners** Group (IPG) announce \$20 billion Just Energy **Transition Partnership** (JETP), 🛃 in part to fund country's transition away from coal



### The electricity mix in Indonesia has been dominated by coal and continues to be so. The share of clean power has remained largely constant over the past two decades.xiii,5





xiii Clean power includes all renewables (incl. hydro) and nuclear power.





### PLN has a de-facto monopoly on transmission, distribution, and retail. On generation, it produces two-thirds of the country's power with the remainder produced by independent power producers (IPPs) and captive coal plants.<sup>6</sup>







ration	Transmission	Distribution	Sales/Retail	Consumptio
				Commercia 20%
				Industrial 34%
	PLN 100%	PLN 100%	PLN 100%	
				Residentia <b>46</b> %







### Ownership of Indonesian coal power is split between PLN and IPPs. Recently, there has been significant new investment in IPP coal power.<sup>7</sup>

Anı	nual Coa	l Investm	nent — IPP	An	inual Coa
\$50 bil	lion —				
\$40 —		<b>\$</b> — 8 6%	<b>1%</b>		
Ş <del>τ</del> υ	<b>∟⊢− 7</b> :	1%			
\$30 —					
\$20 —					
\$10 —					
\$0 _	2000	2000	2007	2000	2000
	2000	2006	2007	2008	2009





### On both an economy-wide and project finance basis, Indonesia has high costs of financing – though in the same ballpark as developing economies – that translates to high levelized costs for renewable energy.<sup>8</sup>

### **Economy-wide Cost of Financing Estimates**









### As a result, international financing (especially concessional debt) from development finance institutions (DFIs) has played a significant role in financing power investments.<sup>9</sup>





Breakdown of Indonesian Power Project Financing, by Source, Type, Origin, and Instrument







### Endnotes

- 2. "Indonesia data explorer", International Energy Agency
- weo-database/2022/October

- Analysis\_2021.pdf
- www.iea.org/articles/the-cost-of-capital-in-clean-energy-transitions



1. "Indonesia data explorer", International Energy Agency, last accessed February 15, 2023, https://www.iea.org/countries/indonesia 🗹

3. "World economic outlook database", International Monetary Fund, last accessed February 15, 2023, https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/WEO/

4. Timothy Goodson, and Thomas Spencer, An Energy Sector Roadmap to Net Zero Emissions in Indonesia, International Energy Agency, September 2022, https://www.iea.org/reports/an-energy-sector-roadmap-to-net-zero-emissions-in-indonesia

5. "Indonesia: Energy Country Profile", Our World in Data, last accessed February 22, 2023, https://ourworldindata.org/energy/country/indonesia 🗹

6. System Value Analysis – Indonesia, World Economic Forum, November 2021, https://www3.weforum.org/docs/Indonesia\_System\_Value\_

7. "Coal Asset Transition Tool", Transition Zero, last accessed February 22, 2023, https://www.transitionzero.org/products/coal-asset-transition-tool 🗹

8. "Cost of Capital Observatory", International Energy Agency, last accessed February 22, 2023, https://www.iea.org/data-and-statistics/data-tools/ cost-of-capital-observatory; 🗹 and "The cost of capital in clean energy transitions", International Energy Agency, 17 December 2021, https://

9. Lucila Arboleya, Attracting investment to fund sustainable recoveries: The case of Indonesia's power sector, International Energy Agency, July 2020, https://www.iea.org/reports/attracting-private-investment-to-fund-sustainable-recoveries-the-case-of-indonesias-power-sector 🗹



